STATUS:

S 6733 SALAND Same as Uni. A 9555 Lentol (MS)

Governor Program #29

ON FILE: 03/14/12 Criminal Procedure Law

TITLE....Relates to DNA testing of certain offenders convicted of a crime

convicted of	i a crime
03/14/12	REFERRED TO RULES
03/14/12	ORDERED TO THIRD READING
	CAL.366
03/14/12	MESSAGE OF NECESSITY - 3 DAY
	MESSAGE
03/14/12	PASSED SENATE
03/14/12	DELIVERED TO ASSEMBLY
03/15/12	referred to codes

03/15/12 DELIVERED TO ASSEMBLY referred to codes substituted for a9555

03/15/12 ordered to third reading rules cal.18 message of necessity - 3 day message

03/15/12 passed assembly o3/15/12 returned to senate

03/15/12 DELIVERED TO GOVERNOR

A9555 Lentol (MS) Same as Uni. S 6733 SALAND

Governor Program # 29

Criminal Procedure Law

03/15/12 03/15/12

03/15/12

03/15/12

TITLE....Relates to DNA testing of certain offenders convicted of a crime

convicted of	a crime
03/14/12	referred to codes
03/15/12	reported referred to rules
03/15/12	reported
03/15/12	rules report cal.18
03/15/12	substituted by s6733
S06733	SALAND
03/14/12	REFERRED TO RULES
03/14/12	ORDERED TO THIRD READING
	CAL.366
03/14/12	MESSAGE OF NECESSITY - 3 DAY
	MESSAGE
03/14/12	PASSED SENATE
03/14/12	DELIVERED TO ASSEMBLY
03/15/12	referred to codes
03/15/12	substituted for a9555
03/15/12	ordered to third reading rules cal.18

passed assembly

returned to senate

message of necessity - 3 day message

DELIVERED TO GOVERNOR

VOTING:

03/15/12	S6733	Assembly Vote	Yes: 135	No: 4
03/14/12	S6733	Senate Vote	Aye: 36	Nay: 0

Go to Top of Page

Floor Votes:

03/15/12 S6733 Assembly Vote Yes: 135 No: 4

Yes	Abbate	Yes	Abinanti	Yes	Amedore	Yes	Arroyo
Yes	Aubry	Yes	Barclay	No	Barron	Yes	Benedetto
Yes	Blankenbush	Yes	Boyland	Yes	Boyle	Yes	Braunstein
Yes	Brennan	Yes	Brindisi	Yes	Bronson	Yes	Brook-Krasny
ER	Burling	Yes	Butler	Yes	Cahill	Yes	Calhoun
Yes	Camara	Yes	Canestrari	Yes	Castelli	Yes	Castro
Yes	Ceretto	Yes	Clark	Yes	Colton	Yes	Conte
Yes	Cook	Yes	Corwin	No	Crespo	Yes	Crouch
Yes	Curran	Yes	Cusick	Yes	Cymbrowitz	ER	DenDekker
Yes	Dinowitz	Yes	Duprey	Yes	Englebright	Yes	Espinal

YesGabryszakYesGalefERGanttNoGibsonYesGiglioYesGlickYesGoldfederYesGoodell	
_	
W C 4C: 1 W C C W C 41 A W H	
Yes Gottfried Yes Graf Yes Gunther A Yes Hanna	
Yes Hawley ER Heastie Yes Hevesi Yes Hikind	
Yes Hooper Yes Jacobs Yes Jaffee Yes Jeffries	
Yes Johns Yes Jordan Yes Katz Yes Kavanagt	Ĺ
Yes Kellner Yes Kolb Yes Lancman Yes Latimer	
Yes Lavine Yes Lentol Yes Lifton Yes Linares	
Yes Lopez P Yes Lopez V Yes Losquadro Yes Lupardo	
Yes Magee Yes Magnarelli Yes Maisel Yes Malliotak	is
Yes Markey Yes McDonough Yes McEneny Yes McKevitt	
Yes McLaughlin Yes Meng Yes Miller D Yes Miller J	
Yes Miller M Yes Millman Yes Montesano Yes Morelle	
Yes Moya Yes Murray Yes Nolan Yes Oaks	
Yes O'Donnell Yes Ortiz Yes Palmesano Yes Paulin	
No Peoples-Stokes Yes Perry Yes Pretlow Yes Quart	
Yes Ra Yes Rabbitt Yes Raia Yes Ramos	
Yes Reilich Yes Reilly Yes Rivera J Yes Rivera N	
Yes Rivera P Yes Roberts ER Robinson Yes Rodriguez	<u> </u>
Yes Rosenthal Yes Russell Yes Ryan Yes Saladino	
Yes Sayward ER Scarborough Yes Schimel Yes Schimmin	ger
Yes Simanowitz Yes Simotas Yes Smardz Yes Stevenson	1
Yes Sweeney Yes Tedisco Yes Tenney Yes Thiele	
Yes Titone Yes Titus Yes Tobacco Yes Walter	
Yes Weinstein Yes Weisenberg Yes Weprin ER Wright	
Yes Zebrowski K Yes Mr. Speaker	

Go to Top of Page

Floor Votes:

03/14/12 S6733 Senate Vote Aye: 36 Nay: 0

Adams	Abs	Addabbo	Aye	Alesi	Abs	Avella
Ball	Aye	Bonacic	Abs	Breslin	Aye	Carlucci
DeFrancisco	Abs	Diaz	Abs	Dilan	Abs	Duane
Espaillat	Aye	Farley	Aye	Flanagan	Aye	Fuschillo
Gallivan	Abs	Gianaris	Aye	Golden	Aye	Griffo
Grisanti	Aye	Hannon	Abs 7	Hassell- Thompson	Abs	Huntley
Johnson	Abs	Kennedy	Aye	Klein	Abs	Krueger
Lanza	Aye	Larkin	Aye	LaValle	Aye	Libous
Little	Aye	Marcellino	Aye	Martins	Aye	Maziarz
McDonald	Abs	Montgomery	Aye	Nozzolio	Aye	O'Mara
Oppenheimer	Abs	Parker	Abs	Peralta	Abs	Perkins
	DeFrancisco Espaillat Gallivan Grisanti Johnson Lanza Little	Ball Aye DeFrancisco Abs Espaillat Aye Gallivan Abs Grisanti Aye Johnson Abs Lanza Aye Little Aye McDonald Abs	BallAyeBonacicDeFranciscoAbsDiazEspaillatAyeFarleyGallivanAbsGianarisGrisantiAyeHannonJohnsonAbsKennedyLanzaAyeLarkinLittleAyeMarcellinoMcDonaldAbsMontgomery	Ball Aye Bonacic Abs DeFrancisco Abs Diaz Abs Espaillat Aye Farley Aye Gallivan Abs Gianaris Aye Grisanti Aye Hannon Abs Johnson Abs Kennedy Aye Lanza Aye Larkin Aye Little Aye Marcellino Aye McDonald Abs Montgomery Aye	BallAyeBonacicAbsBreslinDeFranciscoAbsDiazAbsDilanEspaillatAyeFarleyAyeFlanaganGallivanAbsGianarisAyeGoldenGrisantiAyeHannonAbsHassell-ThompsonJohnsonAbsKennedyAyeKleinLanzaAyeLarkinAyeLaValleLittleAyeMarcellinoAyeMartinsMcDonaldAbsMontgomeryAyeNozzolio	BallAyeBonacicAbsBreslinAyeDeFranciscoAbsDiazAbsDilanAbsEspaillatAyeFarleyAyeFlanaganAyeGallivanAbsGianarisAyeGoldenAyeGrisantiAyeHannonAbsHassell-ThompsonAbsJohnsonAbsKennedyAyeKleinAbsLanzaAyeLarkinAyeLaValleAyeLittleAyeMarcellinoAyeMartinsAyeMcDonaldAbsMontgomeryAyeNozzolioAye

Aye	Ranzenhofer	Aye	Ritchie	Abs	Rivera	Aye	Robach
Aye	Saland	Abs	Sampson	Aye	Savino	Abs	Serrano
Aye	Seward	Aye	Skelos	Abs	Smith	Abs	Squadron
Abs	Stavisky	Abs (Stewart- Cousins	Aye	Valesky	Aye	Young
Ave	Zeldin						

SUMMARY:

SALAND, GOLDEN, SKELOS Amd SS440.30, 240.40 & 440.10, CP L; amd SS995 & 995-c, Exec L Relates to DNA testing of certain offenders convicted of a crime. Governor's Program

BILL TEXT:

STATE OF NEW YORK

s. 6733 A. 9555

SENATE - ASSEMBLY

March 14, 2012

IN SENATE -- Introduced by Sens. SALAND, GOLDEN, SKELOS -- (at request of the Governor) -- read twice and ordered printed, and when printed to be committed to the Committee on Rules

IN ASSEMBLY -- Introduced by M. of A. LENTOL, SILVER, WEINSTEIN, FARRELL, LAVINE, O'DONNELL, CLARK, PAULIN -- Multi-Sponsored by -- M. of A. BRINDISI, BRONSON, CUSICK, GABRYSZAK, GOLDFEDER, HEVESI, LUPARDO, MORELLE, QUART, RAMOS, WEISENBERG, ZEBROWSKI -- (at request of the Governor) -- read once and referred to the Committee on Codes

AN ACT to amend the criminal procedure law and the executive law, in relation to DNA testing of certain offenders convicted of a crime

The People of the State of New York, represented in Senate and Assembly, do enact as follows:

Section 1. Subdivision 1 of section 440.30 of the criminal procedure law is amended to read as follows:

1. (a) A motion to vacate a judgment pursuant to section 440.10 of this article and a motion to set aside a sentence pursuant to section 440.20 of this article must be made in writing and upon reasonable notice to the people. Upon the motion, a defendant who is in a position adequately to raise more than one ground should raise every such ground upon which he or she intends to challenge the judgment or sentence. If the motion is based upon the existence or occurrence of facts, the motion papers must contain sworn allegations thereof, whether by the defendant or by another person or persons. Such sworn allegations may be based upon personal knowledge of the affiant or upon information and belief, provided that in the latter event the affiant must state the sources of such information and the grounds of such belief. The defend-

3 of 14 3/16/2012 12:40 PM

15 ant may further submit documentary evidence or information supporting or

- 16 tending to support the allegations of the moving papers. The people may
- file with the court, and in such case must serve a copy thereof upon the defendant or his <u>or her</u> counsel, if any, an answer denying or admitting
- 19 any or all of the allegations of the motion papers, and may further 20 submit documentary evidence or information refuting or tending to refute
- 21 such allegations. After all papers of both parties have been filed, and
 - ${\tt EXPLANATION--Matter}$ in ${\tt \underline{italics}}$ (underscored) is new; matter in brackets [-] is old law to be omitted.

LBD12113-08-2

3/16/2012 12:40 PM 4 of 14

4

5

6 7

9

13

15

16 17

18

19

20

21 22

25

26

27

29

30

31

32 33

34

35

36

37

38

39 40

41

43

44

46

47

48 49

50

51

S. 6733 2 A. 9555

after all documentary evidence or information, if any, has been submitted, the court must consider the same for the purpose of ascertaining whether the motion is determinable without a hearing to resolve questions of fact.

- (b) In conjunction with the filing or consideration of a motion to vacate a judgment pursuant to section 440.10 of this article by a defendant convicted after a trial, in cases where the court has ordered an evidentiary hearing upon such motion, the court may order that the people produce or make available for inspection property, as defined in subdivision three of section 240.10 of this part, in its possession, custody, or control that was secured in connection with the investigation or prosecution of the defendant upon credible allegations by the defendant and a finding by the court that such property, if obtained, would be probative to the determination of defendant's actual innocence, and that the request is reasonable. The court shall deny or limit such a request upon a finding that such a request, if granted, would threaten the integrity or chain of custody of property or the integrity of the processes or functions of a laboratory conducting DNA testing, pose a risk of harm, intimidation, embarrassment, reprisal, or other substantially negative consequences to any person, undermine the proper functions of law enforcement including the confidentiality of informants, or on the basis of any other factor identified by the court in the interests of justice or public safety. The court shall further ensure that any property produced pursuant to this paragraph is subject to a protec-The court shall deny any request made tive order, where appropriate. pursuant to this paragraph where:
- (i) (1) the defendant's motion pursuant to section 440.10 of this article does not seek to demonstrate his or her actual innocence of the offense or offenses of which he or she was convicted that are the subject of the motion, or (2) the defendant has not presented credible allegations and the court has not found that such property, if obtained, would be probative to the determination of the defendant's actual innocence and that the request is reasonable;
- (ii) the defendant has made his or her motion after five years from the date of the judgment of conviction; provided, however, that this limitation period shall be tolled for five years if the defendant is in custody in connection with the conviction that is the subject of his or her motion, and provided further that, notwithstanding such limitation periods, the court may consider the motion if the defendant has shown: (A) that he or she has been pursuing his or her rights diligently and that some extraordinary circumstance prevented the timely filing of the motion; (B) that the facts upon which the motion is predicated were unknown to the defendant or his or her attorney and could not have been ascertained by the exercise of due diligence prior to the expiration of the statute of limitations; or (C) considering all circumstances of the case including but not limited to evidence of the defendant's guilt, the impact of granting or denying such motion upon public confidence in the criminal justice system, or upon the safety or welfare of the community, and the defendant's diligence in seeking to obtain the requested property or related relief, the interests of justice would be served by considering the motion;
- (iii) the defendant is challenging a judgment convicting him or her of
 an offense that is not a felony defined in section 10.00 of the penal
 law; or

3

5

7

10

11 12

16

17

18

19 20

21

25

27

28

30

31

33

34

35 36

37

38

39

40

41

42

44

45

47

48

50 51

52

53

54

S. 6733 A. 9555

(iv) upon a finding by the court that the property requested in this motion would be available through other means through reasonable efforts by the defendant to obtain such property.

- § 2. Subdivision 1-a of section 440.30 of the criminal procedure law, as amended by chapter 138 of the laws of 2004, is amended to read as follows:
- 1-a. (a) (1) Where the defendant's motion requests the performance of a forensic DNA test on specified evidence, and upon the court's determination that any evidence containing deoxyribonucleic acid ("DNA") was secured in connection with the trial resulting in the judgment, the court shall grant the application for forensic DNA testing of such evidence upon its determination that if a DNA test had been conducted on such evidence, and if the results had been admitted in the trial resulting in the judgment, there exists a reasonable probability that the verdict would have been more favorable to the defendant.
- (2) Where the defendant's motion for forensic DNA testing of specified evidence is made following a plea of guilty and entry of judgment thereon convicting him or her of: (A) a homicide offense defined in article one hundred twenty-five of the penal law, any felony sex offense defined in article one hundred thirty of the penal law, a violent felony offense as defined in paragraph (a) of subdivision one of section 70.02 of the penal law, or (B) any other felony offense to which he or she pled guilty after being charged in an indictment or information in superior court with one or more of the offenses listed in clause (A) of this subparagraph, then the court shall grant such a motion upon its determination that evidence containing DNA was secured in connection with the investigation or prosecution of the defendant, and if a DNA test had been conducted on such evidence and the results had been known to the parties prior to the entry of the defendant's plea and judgment thereon, there exists a substantial probability that the evidence would have established the defendant's actual innocence of the offense or offenses that are the subject of the defendant's motion; provided, however, that:
- (i) the court shall consider whether the defendant had the opportunity to request such testing prior to entering a guilty plea, and, where it finds that the defendant had such opportunity and unjustifiably failed to do so, the court may deny such motion; and
- (ii) a court shall deny the defendant's motion for forensic DNA testing where the defendant has made his or her motion more than five years after entry of the judgment of conviction; except that the limitation period may be tolled if the defendant has shown: (A) that he or she has been pursuing his or her rights diligently and that some extraordinary circumstance prevented the timely filing of the motion for forensic DNA testing; (B) that the facts upon which the motion is predicated were unknown to the defendant or his or her attorney and could not have been ascertained by the exercise of due diligence prior to the expiration of this statute of limitations; or (C) considering all circumstances of the case including but not limited to evidence of the defendant's guilt, the impact of granting or denying such motion upon public confidence in the criminal justice system, or upon the safety or welfare of the community, and the defendant's diligence in seeking to obtain the requested property or related relief, the interests of justice would be served by tolling such limitation period.
- (b) In conjunction with the filing of a motion under this subdivision, the court may direct the people to provide the defendant with information in the possession of the people concerning the current physical location of the specified evidence and if the specified evidence no

10

14 15

17

18

23

25

29

31

35

37

38 39

40

s. 6733 A. 9555

longer exists or the physical location of the specified evidence is unknown, a representation to that effect and information and documentary evidence in the possession of the people concerning the last known physical location of such specified evidence. If there is a finding by the court that the specified evidence no longer exists or the physical location of such specified evidence is unknown, such information in and of itself shall not be a factor from which any inference unfavorable to the people may be drawn by the court in deciding a motion under this section. The court, on motion of the defendant, may also issue a subpoena duces tecum directing a public or private hospital, laboratory or other entity to produce such specified evidence in its possession and/or information and documentary evidence in its possession concerning the location and status of such specified evidence.

- (c) In response to a motion under this paragraph, upon notice to the parties and to the entity required to perform the search the court may order an entity that has access to the combined DNA index system ("CODIS") or its successor system to compare a DNA profile obtained from probative biological material gathered in connection with the investigation or prosecution of the defendant against DNA databanks by keyboard searches, or a similar method that does not involve uploading, upon a court's determination that (1) such profile complies with federal bureau of investigation or state requirements, whichever are applicable and as such requirements are applied to law enforcement agencies seeking such a comparison, and that the data meet state DNA index system and/or national DNA index system criteria as such criteria are applied to law enforcement agencies seeking such a comparison and (2) if such comparison had been conducted, and if the results had been admitted in the trial resulting in the judgment, a reasonable probability exists that verdict would have been more favorable to the defendant, or in a case involving a plea of guilty, if the results had been available to the defendant prior to the plea, a reasonable probability exists that the conviction would not have resulted. For purposes of this subdivision, a "keyboard search" shall mean a search of a DNA profile against the databank in which the profile that is searched is not uploaded to or maintained in the databank.
- § 3. Subdivision 1 of section 240.40 of the criminal procedure law, as amended by chapter 558 of the laws of 1982, the opening paragraph as amended by chapter 317 of the laws of 1983, is amended to read as follows:
- 1. Upon motion of a defendant against whom an indictment, superior court information, prosecutor's information, information, or simplified information charging a misdemeanor is pending, the court in which such 43 accusatory instrument is pending:
- (a) must order discovery as to any material not disclosed upon a 45 demand pursuant to section 240.20, if it finds that the prosecutor's refusal to disclose such material is not justified; (b) must, unless it is satisfied that the people have shown good cause why such an order should not be issued, order discovery or any other order authorized by subdivision one of section 240.70 as to any material not disclosed upon 50 demand pursuant to section 240.20 where the prosecutor has failed to 51 serve a timely written refusal pursuant to section 240.35; [and] (c) may 52 order discovery with respect to any other property, which the people 53 intend to introduce at the trial, upon a showing by the defendant that 54 discovery with respect to such property is material to the preparation 55 of his or her defense, and that the request is reasonable; and (d) where property in the people's possession, custody, or control that consists

5

8

9

10

11

13

14

16

17

18 19

21

26

27

28

29 30

31

33

34 35

36

37

38 39

40 41

43

44 45

46

47

48

49

50

5 s. 6733 A. 9555

of a deoxyribonucleic acid ("DNA") profile obtained from probative biological material gathered in connection with the investigation or prosecution of the defendant and the defendant establishes that such profile complies with federal bureau of investigation or state requirements, whichever are applicable and as such requirements are applied to law enforcement agencies seeking a keyboard search or similar comparison, and that the data meets state DNA index system or national DNA index system criteria as such criteria are applied to law enforcement agencies seeking such a keyboard search or similar comparison, the court may order an entity that has access to the combined DNA index system or successor system to compare such DNA profile against DNA databanks by keyboard searches, or a similar method that does not involve uploading, upon notice to both parties and the entity required to perform the search, upon a showing by the defendant that such a comparison is material to the presentation of his or her defense and that the request is reasonable. For purposes of this paragraph, a "keyboard search" shall mean a search of a DNA profile against the databank in which the profile that is searched is not uploaded to or maintained in the databank. Upon granting the motion pursuant to paragraph (c) [hereof] of this subdivision, the court shall, upon motion of the people showing such to be material to the preparation of their case and that the request is 22 reasonable, condition its order of discovery by further directing discovery by the people of property, of the same kind or character as that authorized to be inspected by the defendant, which he or she intends to introduce at the trial.

- § 4. Subdivision 1 of section 440.10 of the criminal procedure law is amended by adding a new paragraph (g-1) to read as follows:
- (g-1) Forensic DNA testing of evidence performed since the entry of a judgment, (1) in the case of a defendant convicted after a guilty plea, the court has determined that the defendant has demonstrated a substantial probability that the defendant was actually innocent of the offense of which he or she was convicted, or (2) in the case of a defendant convicted after a trial, the court has determined that there exists a reasonable probability that the verdict would have been more favorable to the defendant.
- 5. Subdivision 7 of section 995 of the executive law, as amended by chapter 2 of the laws of 2006, paragraph (a) as separately amended by 320 of the laws of 2006 and paragraph (f) as amended by chapter 405 of the laws of 2010, is amended to read as follows:
- 7. "Designated offender" means a person convicted of [$\frac{and}{sentenced}$ for any one or more of the following provisions of the penal law (a) sections 120.05, 120.10, and 120.11, relating to assault; sections 125.15 through 125.27 relating to homicide; sections 130.25, 130.30, 130.35, 130.40, 130.45, 130.50, 130.65, 130.67 and 130.70, relating to sex offenses; sections 205.10, 205.15, 205.17 and 205.19, relating to escape and other offenses, where the offender has been convicted within the previous five years of one of the other felonies specified in this subdivision; or sections 255.25, 255.26 and 255.27, relating to incest, a violent felony offense as defined in subdivision one of section 70.02 of the penal law, attempted murder in the first degree, as defined in section 110.00 and section 125.27 of the penal law, kidnapping in the first degree, as defined in section 135.25 of the penal law, arson in the first degree, as defined in section 150.20 of the penal law, burglary in the third degree, as defined in section 140.20 of the penal 55 law, attempted burglary in the third degree, as defined in section 56 110.00 and section 140.20 of the penal law, a felony defined in article

55

S. 6733 A. 9555

four hundred ninety of the penal law relating to terrorism or any

2 attempt to commit an offense defined in such article relating to terror-3 ism which is a felony; or (b) criminal possession of a controlled 4 substance in the first degree, as defined in section 220.21 of the penal 5 law; criminal possession of a controlled substance in the second degree, 6 as defined in section 220.18 of the penal law; criminal sale of a 7 controlled substance, as defined in article 220 of the penal law; or 8 grand larceny in the fourth degree, as defined in subdivision five of 9 section 155.30 of the penal law; or (c) any misdemeanor or felony defined as a sex offense or sexually violent offense pursuant to para-10 11 graph (a), (b) or (c) of subdivision two or paragraph (a) of subdivision 12 three of section one hundred sixty-eight-a of the correction law; or (d) 13 any of the following felonies, or an attempt thereof where such attempt 14 is a felony offense: 15 aggravated assault upon a person less than eleven years old, as defined in section 120.12 of the penal law; menacing in the first 16 17 degree, as defined in section 120.13 of the penal law; reckless endan-18 germent in the first degree, as defined in section 120.25 of the penal 19 law; stalking in the second degree, as defined in section 120.55 of the 20 penal law; criminally negligent homicide, as defined in section 125.10 21 of the penal law; vehicular manslaughter in the second degree, as 22 defined in section 125.12 of the penal law; vehicular manslaughter in 23 the first degree, as defined in section 125.13 of the penal law; 24 persistent sexual abuse, as defined in section 130.53 of the penal law; 25 aggravated sexual abuse in the fourth degree, as defined in section 130.65-a of the penal law; female genital mutilation, as defined in 27 section 130.85 of the penal law; facilitating a sex offense with a 28 controlled substance, as defined in section 130.90 of the penal law; 29 unlawful imprisonment in the first degree, as defined in section 135.10 30 of the penal law; custodial interference in the first degree, as defined 31 in section 135.50 of the penal law; criminal trespass in the first 32 degree, as defined in section 140.17 of the penal law; criminal tamper-33 ing in the first degree, as defined in section 145.20 of the penal law; 34 tampering with a consumer product in the first degree, as defined in 35 section 145.45 of the penal law; robbery in the third degree as defined 36 in section 160.05 of the penal law; identity theft in the second degree, 37 as defined in section 190.79 of the penal law; identity theft in the first degree, as defined in section 190.80 of the penal law; promoting 38 39 prison contraband in the first degree, as defined in section 205.25 of 40 the penal law; tampering with a witness in the third degree, as defined 41 in section 215.11 of the penal law; tampering with a witness in the 42 second degree, as defined in section 215.12 of the penal law; tampering 43 with a witness in the first degree, as defined in section 215.13 of the 44 penal law; criminal contempt in the first degree, as defined in subdivi-45 sions (b), (c) and (d) of section 215.51 of the penal law; aggravated 46 criminal contempt, as defined in section 215.52 of the penal law; bail jumping in the second degree, as defined in section 215.56 of the penal 47 48 law; bail jumping in the first degree, as defined in section 215.57 of 49 the penal law; patronizing a prostitute in the second degree, as defined 50 in section 230.05 of the penal law; patronizing a prostitute in the 51 first degree, as defined in section 230.06 of the penal law; promoting 52 prostitution in the second degree, as defined in section 230.30 of the 53 penal law; promoting prostitution in the first degree, as defined in section 230.32 of the penal law; compelling prostitution, as defined in

9 of 14 3/16/2012 12:40 PM

section 230.33 of the penal law; disseminating indecent materials to minors in the second degree, as defined in section 235.21 of the penal

S. 6733 7 A. 9555

law; disseminating indecent materials to minors in the first degree, as 1 2 defined in section 235.22 of the penal law; riot in the first degree, as 3 defined in section 240.06 of the penal law; criminal anarchy, as defined in section 240.15 of the penal law; aggravated harassment of an employee 5 by an inmate, as defined in section 240.32 of the penal law; unlawful surveillance in the second degree, as defined in section 250.45 of the 7 penal law; unlawful surveillance in the first degree, as defined in 8 section 250.50 of the penal law; endangering the welfare of a vulnerable 9 elderly person in the second degree, as defined in section 260.32 of the penal law; endangering the welfare of a vulnerable elderly person in the 10 11 first degree, as defined in section 260.34 of the penal law; use of a 12 child in a sexual performance, as defined in section 263.05 of the penal 13 law; promoting an obscene sexual performance by a child, as defined in 14 section 263.10 of the penal law; possessing an obscene sexual perform-15 ance by a child, as defined in section 263.11 of the penal law; promot-16 ing a sexual performance by a child, as defined in section 263.15 of the 17 penal law; possessing a sexual performance by a child, as defined in 18 section 263.16 of the penal law; criminal possession of a weapon in the 19 third degree, as defined in section 265.02 of the penal law; criminal 20 sale of a firearm in the third degree, as defined in section 265.11 of 21 the penal law; criminal sale of a firearm to a minor, as defined in 22 section 265.16 of the penal law; unlawful wearing of a body vest, as 23 defined in section 270.20 of the penal law; hate crimes as defined in 24 section 485.05 of the penal law; and crime of terrorism, as defined in 25 section 490.25 of the penal law; or (e) a felony defined in the penal law or an attempt thereof where such attempt is a felony; or (f) any of 27 the following misdemeanors: assault in the third degree as defined in 28 section 120.00 of the penal law; attempted aggravated assault upon a 29 person less than eleven years old, as defined in section 110.00 and 30 section 120.12 of the penal law; attempted menacing in the first degree, 31 as defined in section 110.00 and section 120.13 of the penal law; menac-32 ing in the second degree as defined in section 120.14 of the penal law; 33 menacing in the third degree as defined in section 120.15 of the penal 34 law; reckless endangerment in the second degree as defined in section 35 120.20 of the penal law; stalking in the fourth degree as defined in 36 section 120.45 of the penal law; stalking in the third degree as defined 37 in section 120.50 of the penal law; attempted stalking in the second degree, as defined in section 110.00 and section 120.55 of the penal 38 39 law; criminal obstruction of breathing or blood circulation as defined 40 in section 121.11 of the penal law; forcible touching as defined in 41 section 130.52 of the penal law regardless of the age of the victim; 42 sexual abuse in the third degree as defined in section 130.55 of the 43 penal law regardless of the age of the victim; unlawful imprisonment in 44 the second degree as defined in section 135.05 of the penal law regard-45 less of the age of the victim; attempted unlawful imprisonment in the 46 first degree, as defined in section 110.00 and section 135.10 of the 47 penal law regardless of the age of the victim; criminal trespass in the 48 second degree as defined in section 140.15 of the penal law; possession 49 of burglar's tools as defined in section 140.35 of the penal law; petit 50 larceny as defined in section 155.25 of the penal law; endangering the 51 welfare of a child as defined in section 260.10 of the penal law; endan-52 gering the welfare of an incompetent or physically disabled person as 53 defined in section 260.25 of the penal law] any felony defined in any 54 chapter of the laws of the state or any misdemeanor defined in the penal 55 except that where the person is convicted under section 221.10 of the penal law, only a person convicted under subdivision

3

5

10

11

12

13

14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21 22

25

27

28

31

33

37

40

41

45

46

47

s. 6733 A. 9555

section, or a person convicted under subdivision one of such section who stands previously convicted of any crime as defined in subdivision six of section 10.00 of the penal law.

- § 6. Subdivision 3 of section 995-c of the executive law, as amended by chapter 576 of the laws of 2004, is amended to read as follows:
- 3. (a) Any designated offender subsequent to conviction and sentencing for a crime specified in subdivision seven of section nine hundred ninety-five of this article, shall be required to provide a sample appropriate for DNA testing to determine identification characteristics specific to such person and to be included in a state DNA identification index pursuant to this article.
- (b) (i) In the case of a designated offender who is sentenced to a term of imprisonment, such sample shall be collected by the public servant to whose custody the designated offender has been committed.
- (ii) In the case of a designated offender who is sentenced to a of probation, including a sentence of probation imposed in conjunction with a sentence of imprisonment when a sample has not already been taken, such sample shall be collected by the probation department supervising the designated offender.
- (iii) In the case of a designated offender whose sentence does not include either a term of imprisonment or a term of probation, outside of the city of New York, the court shall order that the designated offender report to an office of the sheriff of that county, and when the designated offender does so, such sample shall be collected by the sheriff's office or a court officer. Within the city of New York, the court shall order that the sample be collected by a court officer.
- (iv) Nothing in this paragraph shall prohibit the collection of a DNA sample from a designated offender by any court official, state or local correction official or employee, probation officer, parole officer, police officer, peace officer, other law enforcement official, or designated personnel of the division of criminal justice services who has been notified by the division of criminal justice services that such designated offender has not provided a DNA sample. Upon notification by the division of criminal justice services that a designated offender has not provided a DNA sample, such court official, state or local correction official or employee, probation officer, parole officer, police officer, peace officer or other law enforcement official, or designated personnel of the division of criminal justice services shall collect the DNA sample.
- § 7. Nothing in this act shall be construed to create or impose an affirmative obligation upon laboratories, police departments, district attorneys, or any other law enforcement agencies or personnel to retain or preserve property that may contain DNA if such obligation did not exist prior to the effective date of this act, provided, however, that nothing in this act shall be construed to affect or remove any such obligation if it did exist prior to the effective date of this act.
- \S 8. The actual costs incurred in connection with DNA testing or keyboard searches performed pursuant to subdivision 1-a of section 440.30 of the criminal procedure law shall be borne by the defendant 50 requesting such testing or searches, provided, however that the court, 51 taking into account the defendant's financial resources, as well as any 52 of the defendant's financial obligations, shall make a determination 53 whether or not the payment of such cost would impose a hardship upon the 54 defendant, and in such case, the state shall bear such costs.
- § 9. This act shall take effect October 1, 2012; provided, however, 56 that the amendments to subdivision 7 of section 995 of the executive law

3/16/2012 12:40 PM 11 of 14

S. 6733 9 A. 9555

- 1 made by section five of this act shall apply to conviction of designated
- 2 offenses, and subparagraph two of paragraph (a) of subdivision 1-a of
- 3 section 440.30 of the criminal procedure law as added by section two of
- 4 this act shall apply to a guilty plea entered, on or after such effec-
- 5 tive date.

SPONSORS MEMO:

NEW YORK STATE SENATE INTRODUCER'S MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT submitted in accordance with Senate Rule VI. Sec 1

BILL NUMBER: S6733

SPONSOR: SALAND

TITLE OF BILL:

An act to amend the criminal procedure law and the executive law, in relation to DNA testing of certain offenders convicted of a crime

PURPOSE:

This legislation would amend the Criminal Procedure Law ("CPL") and Executive Law ("EL") to expand the collection of DNA samples from defendants convicted of crimes in New York State to include, for the first time in this state and across the country, all felonies and all penal law misdemeanors. The bill would also enhance the protections afforded defendants to demonstrate their actual innocence by providing access in certain circumstances to DNA testing in post-plea contexts. In addition, the bill would provide a mechanism for defendants convicted after a trial who have obtained a hearing on a post-conviction motion seeking to demonstrate actual innocence for certain discovery from the people to facilitate such a hearing.

SUMMARY OF PROVISIONS:

Section 1 of the bill would amend subdivision 1 of CPL § 440.30 to provide for discovery of property in the possession, custody and control of the prosecution in certain circumstances where a defendant filing a post-conviction motion after trial has asserted his or her actual innocence and has obtained an evidentiary hearing. There is a statute of limitations for bringing such a motion depending on whether a defendant is incarcerated or not. This provision would ensure maximum protection of victims and the integrity of the criminal justice process, as well.

Section 2 of the bill would amend subdivision 1-a of CPL \S 440.30 to provide for DNA testing under certain circumstances to defendants convicted after entering a guilty plea in conjunction with a post-conviction motion to vacate the judgment, and to provide for DNA "keyboard searches" to be performed upon a court's order.

Section 3 of the bill would amend subdivision 1 of CPL \S 240.40 to provide for DNA "keyboard searches" to be performed under certain circumstances upon a court's order before trial.

Section 4 of the bill would amend subdivision 1 of CPL § 440.10 to set the standard for post-conviction motions seeking to vacate a judgment

based upon the results of DNA testing by providing that the defendant must demonstrate a substantial probability that he or she is actually innocent of the offense of which he or she was convicted or that there is a reasonable probability that the verdict would have been more favorable to the defendant.

Section 5 of the bill would amend subdivision 7 of EL § 995 to mandate that DNA samples be collected from all offenders convicted of any felony defined in any chapter of the laws of the state or any misdemeanor defined in the penal law. Where an individual is convicted of the class B misdemeanor of possessing marihuana or smoking marihuana in plain view but has never been convicted of any crime before, DNA is not collected from that defendant; if the defendant has been convicted of any crime, then DNA is collected from him or her.

Section 6 of the bill would amend subdivision 3 of EL §995-c to provide for the administration of the collection of DNA samples from convicted offenders.

Section 7 clarifies that nothing in the act should be construed to create, impose, affect, or remove any existing obligation on laboratories, police departments, district attorneys, or any other law enforcement agencies to retain or preserve property that may contain DNA.

Section 8 provides that the actual costs incurred for DNA testing or "keyboard searches" performed pursuant to subdivision 1-a of CPL §440.30 be borne by the defendant, provided, however, that the State would bear such costs upon a court's finding that, taking into account a defendant's financial resources and financial obligations, the payment of such costs would impose a hardship.

Section 9 provides the effective dates of the provisions of the bill. The portions of the bill relating to post-plea DNA testing would apply only to pleas entered on or after the effective date and the collection of DNA would occur for crimes committed on or after the effective date.

EXISTING LAW:

The existing provisions govern DNA: (1) DNA testing and post-conviction motions are in CPL \$ 440; (2) pre-trial discovery are in CPL \$ 240; (3) DNA collection for the state DNA identification system are in EL \$ 995; and (4) the Commission on Forensic Science are in EL \$995.

STATEMENT IN SUPPORT:

The DNA identification index ("Databank") is a powerful tool both for preventing and solving crimes and for establishing a defendant's innocence. Since its inception in 1996, there have been more than 10,000 hits against the Databank resulting in over 2,900 convictions. Currently, convicted offenders who are in the Databank have, on average, been convicted of three crimes — and in some cases as many as 30 crimes — for which no DNA has been collected before they were convicted of the DNA—eligible offense. Because individuals who commit serious crimes also commit less serious crimes, collecting DNA from individuals convicted of any Penal Law misdemeanor and all felonies will help to prevent and solve murders, rapes, and other crimes. The last expansion of the Databank that included petit larceny provides concrete evidence of the promise that this expansion holds: when petit larceny was added to list of DNA eligible crimes in 2006, it resulted in solving almost 1000 crimes, including 223 rapes and 53 homicides.

The Databank also plays a significant role in helping to determine who did not commit a crime. There have been 27 individuals exonerated in New York through DNA evidence, as well as countless suspects who have been

excluded and cleared most often at the earliest stages of an investigation. This legislation provides for expanded access to defendants, both before trial and after plea or conviction, to DNA testing and other discovery to demonstrate their innocence.

BUDGET IMPLICATIONS:

This legislation is not expected to have a significant impact on the State's budget.

EFFECTIVE DATE:

This act shall take effect October 1, 2012.