



**Interfaith IMPACT** of New York State

## **Testimony for the New York State Senate Select Committee on Budget and Tax Reform**

### **WHAT IS JUST TAXATION?**

**Submitted by the Rev. Dr. Richard S. Gilbert, Regional Vice President (Western New York), Interfaith Impact of NYS**

Thank you Sen. Krueger and members of the Select Committee for giving me this opportunity to provide a progressive religious overview of just taxation policies.

New York State, like the rest of the country, is in fiscal crisis. To bridge the budget deficit of over \$13 billion Governor Paterson has proposed severe cuts in the areas of health and education, among others. The Assembly has passed, with the support of religious and labor groups and their Fair Share program, a so-called “millionaires tax,” raising the marginal tax rate on couples making \$250,000 or more. Needless to say, the proposal is controversial. What is missing in this discussion is a moral argument for what would be a just system of taxation. What is the moral basis for taxation that would be a fair way to support governmental services? I suggest the following principles:

1. **“Good fortune obligates.”** The phrase is from Albert Schweitzer as he contemplated the trajectory of his life from privileged preacher’s son to the mythical doctor in Africa. He believed, as do I, that those of us who have been fortunate in securing life resources, whether it be the result of hard work or good fortune or both, “owe the pot,” as it has been put.
2. **All of us have give-back responsibility.** All of us have benefited greatly from the hard work of others – historical figures, our family and our society. This reality challenges the dogma of the rugged individual who deserves everything he/she can get as if his/her efforts alone were responsible. We always depend on others.
3. **How much is enough?** When CEO’s, sports personalities, entertainers and others command salaries in six figures and more while many work full-time and yet live in poverty, there is a violation of the covenant of shared responsibility for the common good.
4. **In a competitive society, what do we do with the losers?** If we accept competition then we must allocate resources not only to the “winners,” but also to those who cannot compete as well. Taxation is a public policy to level the playing field and create the conditions for a democratic society. Dramatically unequal societies have a poor track record.

5. **"Taxes are the price we pay for civilization"** (Oliver Wendell Holmes). They are a down payment of our investment in the common good. Those with extensive resources should expect to pay their fair share.

6. **What is a "fair share"?** While there is no objective measure of "fair," the concept of progressive taxation exacts a proportional share from those who bear the burden of society's costs. Tax rates should be based on the ability to pay. While the affluent pay a high percentage of the income tax, when all other taxes are considered, rich and poor pay at a similar rate. See tax expert David Cay Johnston in his book "Perfectly Legal." According to him the poorest first pay 17% of their income in taxes, while the richest fifth pay 18%. That 17% impacts the poor more powerfully as it cuts into basic necessities of life; the 18% the wealthiest pay merely impacts the superfluities of their lives.

7. **Superfluity and scarcity.** A proportionate ethic suggests that it is unjust for some human beings to possess far more than is needed for a comfortable life while other equally valuable (morally) human beings have inadequate resources for living a meaningful life.

8. **Government is the leveler of the playing field.** It is that democratic covenant that sets the rules for fair play, regulates the excesses of the marketplace and provides a safety net for those who are marginalized. Taxes are a privilege as well as a responsibility.

Interfaith Impact of New York State supports efforts to create a more just taxation system in New York by increasing the number of tax brackets so that those earning \$250,000 a year or more would pay higher income taxes.

Respectfully Submitted by  
 Rev. Richard S. Gilbert  
 Regional Vice President, Interfaith Impact of NYS  
 646 State Street  
 Albany, NY 12203  
 518-463-5652  
[info@interfaithimpactnys.org](mailto:info@interfaithimpactnys.org)  
[www.Interfaithimpactnys.org](http://www.Interfaithimpactnys.org)

***Interfaith Impact of NYS: Working for Social Justice through Progressive Religious Advocacy***

**Board of Directors:** Paul Rees-Rohrbacher, President; Don Odell, Secretary; John E. Keevert, Treasurer; The Rev. Dr. Richard S. Gilbert, Regional Vice President (Western New York); The Rev. Raymond E. Strawn, Jr., Regional Vice President (Long Island); The Rev. Steve Clunn; Sarah Birn, Esq.; Kenneth Bollerud; Ann Brandon; The Rev. Dr. Tom Davis; DeWitt Ellinwood; The Rev. Dr. Richard S. Gilbert; Herbert Gordon; Eileen Hamlin; Harsey Leonard; Damaris McGuire; Pat Rector; Ruth Sabo, Ph. D.; Niels Schulz; Judy Schwartz; Rev. Sam Trumbore; Barbara Zaron. **Clergy Advisory Board:** The Rev. Kaaren Anderson; The Rev. Kenneth I. Applegate; The Rev. Dr. Lynn Ashley; Rabbi Henry Bamberger; The Rev. Johanna Barrett; The Rev. Michelle Bogue-Trost; The Rev. Ben Bortin; The Rev. Stephen C. Butler; The Rev. Dr. Thomas A. Chulak; Rabbi Matthew Cutler; Rabbi Jerome K. Davidson, D.D.; Rabbi Joshua M. Davidson; The Rev. Larry A. Deyss; The Rev. Linda Dolby; Rabbi Debora S. Gordon; The Rev. Dr. Paula J. Gravelle; Rabbi Daniel Gropper; The Rev. Margaret Hart; Rabbi Alan J. Katz; Rabbi Lawrence A. Kotok; The Rev. Robert C. Lamar; The Rev. Dr. William A. Lasher; The Rev. Christopher Luedde; Pastor Alexandra S. Lusak; Rabbi Linda Motzkin; The Rev. Dr. Hugh Nevin; The Rev. Larry Phillips; Rabbi Daniel Polish; The Rev. Judith Quarles; The Very Rev. David Robinson; Rabbi Harry Rosenfeld; Rabbi Jonathan Rubenstein; Rabbi Scott Shpeen; The Rev. Bruce Southworth; The Rev. Dr. Charles H. Straut, Jr.; The Rev. Scott Tayler; The Rev. David Weissbard; The Rev. Wade Wheelock; Rabbi Michael A. White; The Rev. Robert A. White.  
**Staff:** Robb Smith, M.A., Executive Director; Lisa Strawn, Office Assistant  
**Address:** 646 State Street, Albany NY 12203; [www.interfaithimpactnys.org](http://www.interfaithimpactnys.org); [info@interfaithimpactnys.org](mailto:info@interfaithimpactnys.org); 518-463-5652.