

BRAD HOYLMAN
27TH SENATE DISTRICT

DISTRICT OFFICE
322 EIGHTH AVENUE, SUITE 1700
NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10001
PHONE: (212) 633-8052
FAX: (212) 633-8096

ALBANY OFFICE
ROOM 413
LEGISLATIVE OFFICE BLDG.
ALBANY, NEW YORK 12247
PHONE: (518) 455-2451
FAX (518) 426-6846

E-MAIL: HOYLMAN@NYSENATE.GOV
WEBSITE: HOYLMAN.NYSENATE.GOV



THE SENATE
STATE OF NEW YORK
ALBANY

RANKING MINORITY MEMBER:

CONSUMER PROTECTION
INVESTIGATIONS &
GOVERNMENT OPERATIONS

COMMITTEES:

CODES
CRIME VICTIMS, CRIME &
CORRECTION
CULTURAL AFFAIRS, TOURISM,
PARKS & RECREATION
JUDICIARY

TESTIMONY BY NEW YORK STATE SENATOR BRAD HOYLMAN
BEFORE THE NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF SANITATION
ON THE DRAFT SCOPE OF ANALYSIS FOR THE
DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT REGARDING
THE PROPOSED EAST 25TH STREET SANITATION GARAGE
CERQ 13-DOS-007M

June 25, 2013

My name is Brad Hoylman and I represent New York State's 27th Senate District, in which the proposed East 25th Street Sanitation Garage is located and which includes portions of Manhattan Community Districts 3 and 6, which the facility is intended to serve. Thank you for the opportunity to present my comments on the Draft Scope of Work for the Draft Environmental Impact Statement ("DEIS") on the proposed garage before the New York City Department of Sanitation ("DSNY") today.

As you know, DSNY is proposing a garage that is approximately 135 feet tall, on a footprint of approximately 76,320 square feet, containing approximately 470,000 gross square feet of floor area, in the middle of the block bounded by First Avenue to the west, the FDR Drive to the east and 26th Street and 25th Street to the north and south, respectively. This location is surrounded by densely populated residential neighborhoods, including Waterside Plaza, a nearly 1,500 unit waterfront community that is already substantially cut off from the rest of Manhattan, Stuyvesant Town/Peter Cooper Village, the storied 11,000-unit middle income rental complex, and East Midtown Plaza, a 748-unit Mitchell-Lama Co-op. In addition, it is sandwiched between Bellevue Hospital, a New York State-Designated Regional Trauma Center and the Manhattan Veterans Affairs Hospital, and is across the street from new parkland at Asser Levy Place. The proposed garage would house refuse and recycling collection trucks, salt spreaders and snow plows for Manhattan Community Districts 6 and 8, street cleaning vehicles for Manhattan Community Districts 3, 6 and 8, as well as the DSNY Manhattan Borough Office. Its mid-block siting would leave parcels for development on either side.

I would like to thank Manhattan Community Board 6 ("CB 6") for the attention and consideration it has given this proposal, as well as Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney, Councilmember Dan Garodnick and Assembly Member Brian Kavanaugh, for their thoughtful insights. I strongly encourage DSNY to continue to work collaboratively with the community to



address its concerns. While I recognize that the proposed consolidation of three existing DSNY garages into one would replace outdated facilities and improve operational efficiencies, I share CB6's concerns regarding the significant impacts the consolidated garage would have on its surrounding neighborhood.

I remain concerned that DSNY has not fully answered several key questions regarding this proposal, notably whether any other sites within the Community Districts that would be served were studied as part of the site selection, whether assurances can be made that only empty trucks would be parked at the consolidated garage, and whether public review of the facility may be done in the context of the entire block rather than as a stand-alone proposal. I strongly agree with my government colleagues that review of all three parcels on the block must be done in one action to ensure the inclusion of the significant community benefits that ought to be associated with a project of this type, which relies on the sale of city property, and to ensure a cohesive result that strengthens the neighborhood fabric. Full knowledge of the intended end-block development is needed for the DEIS to reflect an accurate prediction of the impacts on the neighborhood and surrounding communities. Any scoping document must reflect the possibilities of major residential, commercial or institutional uses on either or both of the two remaining parcels. This proposal is not one that is urgent, and I strongly believe that DSNY should hold off on further action regarding this siting until it has addressed these concerns.

Regardless of how DSNY proceeds, the project's transportation impacts must be meticulously and comprehensively studied. As we have seen in other places in our city, even small changes to a neighborhood can have huge impacts on both traffic and public transportation. The large volume of trucks moving in and out of such a facility, as well as the personal vehicles of staff, may create an untenable situation that disrupts traffic patterns far beyond the surrounding blocks. First Avenue is already highly congested at nearly all hours of the day, and the exit ramp of the FDR Drive results in a high volume of speeding vehicles turning down the narrow side street. Blocking any of the surrounding streets for any length of time for fuel or supply delivery may result in a dangerous back-up of traffic onto the FDR or down First Avenue, resulting in a perilous situation for drivers, cyclists and pedestrians alike. Further, the traffic study must take into account the needs of Bellevue Hospital's emergency bay, which exits on to 26th Street. As one of the area's major trauma centers DSNY must have clear plans that will allow continuous and uninterrupted traffic flow from the hospital at all times.

The DEIS must take into account the travel patterns of Waterside Plaza residents, many of whom use the 25th Street footbridge to come and go from the complex, and walk across 25th Street between the FDR and First Avenue, resulting in an unusually high number of pedestrians on this block. The DEIS must fully examine any impacts construction would have on Waterside residents' use of the footbridge and the safety of these pedestrians when they are on the Western side. Further, the DEIS should examine the possibility of reconstructing the city-owned side of the footbridge, which touches ground within the proposed development site, to be compliant with the Americans with Disabilities Act.

Because this location would be consolidating three existing garages, total sanitation truck miles may be decreased; however, more of the miles traveled would be centered around a single neighborhood. Given the huge increase in local truck traffic expected from a proposal of this

type, the DEIS must include a full analysis of the expected change in air quality surrounding the site, including its impacts on the neighboring hospitals and schools which may be located outside of the standard "sensitive receptor" site radius, but which would be impacted by any decrease in air quality.

It is vital that the DEIS address the noise impacts that would result from hundreds of vehicles leaving and returning to the garage. As noted above, the proposed garage would be bordered by several residential developments, and increased truck traffic, particularly in the morning hours as trucks leave for the day, would be very disruptive to the neighborhood.

The current proposal would result in several thousand gallons of fuel and oil being stored in the heart of New York's hospital corridor, and directly adjacent to the FDR, one of our city's major thoroughfares. The proximity of the fuel tanks to such sensitive sites poses an obvious safety threat, and I would like to see the DEIS include an analysis of the security risks, as well as the potential damage that could be caused in the event of a devastating accident, act of nature, or intentional act.

Thank you for your attention to my and the community's concerns on this important matter. I look forward to seeing how they are addressed in the DEIS, and to continuing to participate in the ongoing public process.