

The League of Women Voters of New York State 62 Grand Street, Albany, New York 12207
Phone: 518-465-4162 Fax: 518-465-0812
www.lwvny.org E-Mail: lwvny@lwvny.org

# THE LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS of New York State

# JOINT LEGISLATIVE PUBLIC HEARING ON 2016-2017 EXECUTIVE BUDGET PROPOSAL: ELEMENTARY & SECONDARY EDUCATION TESTIMONY SUBMITTED TO THE ASSEMBLY WAYS AND MEANS, SENATE FINANCE AND ASSEMBLY AND SENATE EDUCATION COMMITTEES

### **JANUARY 27, 2016**

Good afternoon. I am Marian Bott, Education Finance Issue Specialist for the League of Women Voters of New York State. Our State Finances position¹ encompasses the operation and impact of 1) state school aid distribution, 2) the State's School Tax Relief (STAR) and property tax cap programs, and 3) charter schools. The League is a nonpartisan organization devoted to promoting active and informed involvement of individuals in government. We thank the Legislature for this opportunity to provide recommendations about the 2016-2017 proposed Pre-K-12 education budget.²

I have researched and presented testimony each year for this day since the late 1990's, and have never missed attending each full day. As a League volunteer I make this commitment because our concerned members include professional educators and countless current and former members of school boards, parents and grandparents of students, and community organization heads who have worked tirelessly for quality education in our communities. In other words, yes, we are stakeholders.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See Financing Education K-12, Statement of Position at <a href="http://lwvny.org/advocacy/impact/2015/State-Finances/STATE-FINANCES-EDUCATION.pdf">http://lwvny.org/advocacy/impact/2015/State-Finances/STATE-FINANCES-EDUCATION.pdf</a>. The League also holds positions on Election Law, Government, Health Care, Judicial, Natural Resources, Social Policy, Women's Issues. See <a href="http://lwvny.org/advocacy/impact/SF">http://lwvny.org/advocacy/impact/SF</a> Full.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Appropriations bills S. 6403/A. 9003 (Education, Labor and Family Assistance), S6409/A9009 (Revenue/STAR) and related Article VII Education, Labor, Housing and Family Assistance bills S6406/A9006 (12672-01-6) (Part A concerning state education aid and Part F concerning the DREAM Act) and Article VII Revenue Bill 12674-01-06 (Parts A-G concerning amendments to STAR).

We would like to begin with three points of agreement with this year's Executive Budget. We have stated them in terms of policy recommendations. We appreciate that this year's budget does not bundle policy and budget decisions for education, giving us a more straightforward and transparent set of documents with which to work.

### 1) USE PROGRESSIVE POLICIES FOR STATE AID

Clearly the Governor recommends a progressive distribution of state aid to education, with many formulas that benefit the higher needs school districts. We agree with this policy. Higher-needs districts, particularly New York City, have been patient for ten years since the Campaign for Fiscal Equity decision in 2006, and the inequities identified therein have been increasingly side-lined as legislators have been pressured to increase Gap Elimination Adjustment (GEA) funding. Much effort was put forth to streamline a new Foundation Aid formula which now is competing, ironically, for approximately \$550 million of aid that falls outside the "reimbursement for expense-based aids" (\$408 million) in the total proposed school aid increase (proposed at \$991 million in the Executive Budget). The Governor's budget attempts, perhaps too generously, to strike a balance between GEA and Foundation Aid increases in an effort to enact a timely budget. As to the \$991 million's overall adequacy, as the New York State Regents' Proposal<sup>9</sup> well explains, an additional \$2.1 billion in state aid would be a more responsive increase in state aid. When fiscal watchdogs complain that New York State's per-pupil average is too high, our response is that hold-harmless policies over the long term come at a price. . We do not agree that "average" per pupil expenditure is an appropriate subject for criticism. Instead, New Yorkers should boast about its positive impacts, understanding the pride that wealthy public school districts maintain for their students' accomplishments and the work done by our exemplary district educators. If all districts could spend as lavishly as the wealthy ones, perhaps more of our state's students could experience the educational outcomes that are achieved in our best-resourced districts. This should be the equalizing goal of state aid.

### 2) REGIONS ARE NOT STUDENTS

One of the more telling comments in one of the two books prepared by staff describing the Executive Budget had to do with the analysis of the respective benefits of paying down the full Gap Elimination Adjustment of \$433 million vs. using funds for other aspects of state aid. The comment of the staff analyst was that from a "regional perspective" eliminating the GEA for average and high wealth districts was appropriate. The Executive Budget correctly recognizes that the state's role is not to subsidize the wealthiest regions.

As a statewide organization, we can't imagine anything less important to the overall well-being of the state's students as a whole. The legislature should aid the neediest students using a transparent weighting methodology, regardless of where they live, not the neediest regions. Our organization's positions oppose prioritizing wealthy districts over poorer ones. We support regional cost adjustments but not regional shares. The High Tax Aid line item is an example of this regional horse-trading. Of the \$223 million allocated in this year's proposed budget, \$88 million goes to Suffolk, \$58 million to Nassau, and \$12 million to Westchester—all regions with high Regional Costs which also get receive large STAR and property tax relief allocations. The Division of the Budget booklet this year doesn't provide the formula for High Tax Aid, a carry-over from a frozen allocation with a 2009 complicated three-tier structure. We have included the formula, as well as this year's recipients of High Tax Aid as an attachment. Some of these High Tax Aid allocations should make you ask whether it would be

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Regents 2016-17 Proposal on State Aid to School Districts, December 7, 2015

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See Attachments 1 and 2 hereto.

preferable to eliminate this this category, replete with hold-harmless grants, and instead allocate funds through the Foundation Aid formula.

# 3) GOVERNOR'S STAFF RECOGNIZES THAT STAR AID IS PROBABLY NOT ALWAYS NEEDED OR LEGALLY GRANTED

We have maintained that a Property Tax Circuit Breaker would have, from the very beginning, been a more appropriate means of providing relief to specific taxpayers, based on their income. While the phase-out delineated in the Executive Budget is laudable, eventually the income limits should be reduced because it is difficult to argue that, given a median income of \$55,000 in our State, families with \$500,000 of income need to receive up to \$2,500 in property tax reductions through STAR. It is a sad commentary on public policy implementation that, once again, lawmakers believe that checks issued as state compensation for property taxes already paid by citizens throughout the state is the way to ensure re-election—in effect round-trip taxation policy. A property tax circuit breaker would provide a more precise tool with which to allocate resources for tax relief. STAR wastes state tax resources in far too many cases and has exacerbated spending differences among school districts.

Now we will address our major objections to proposals in the Executive Budget.

### 1) DO NOT ENACT ANY VOUCHER OR SCHOLARSHIP TAX CREDIT LEGISLATION.

We oppose the use of public taxpayer dollars to support private educational institutions, and we reiterate our objections to the bills proposed by the Executive as well as the Senate and the Assembly. We do not believe that members of the Legislature should let others decide how or whether to fund private education for constituents. These proposals take away the Legislature's authority to allocate the tax credit funds—instead these bills as crafted allow the biggest lobbying firms' clients, and you know who they are, to decide on "new" funding that represents, depending on which version, well over 10-15% of new funding.<sup>5</sup>

This year we will present our detailed criticisms at the Tax hearings to be held on February 2. You have already received our latest memorandum dated January 13, and you can expect to hear more from us during the weeks to come. This unfair tax credit has been increasingly promoted and funded by groups that have now invested in the talent of practically all of the top lobbying firms in Albany, as well as out-of-state lobbyists. We also take issue with the possibility that the power to decide education policy could be concentrated in very few hands by virtue of the use of Limited Liability Corporations which share a common management

### 2) DO NOT REWARD CHARTER SCHOOLS FOR DISCRIMINATORY PRACTICES

This past fall we conducted a mini-study of charter schools in Assembly District 68, in which I reside. The study focused on the district's 17 charter schools. Data concerning racial demographics as well as these schools' percentages of students with disabilities, English Language Learners and students living in poverty show a wide variation among these 17 schools. This small sampling led us to conclude that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Under the Executive Budget proposal, at \$150 MM estimated to be a 2019 FY Tax Credit line item, this would be 15% of a \$1 billion new funding allocation, for example. This year's \$991 million recommended increase in funding is budgeted as a 16-17 School Year increase. If the cost were incurred in this School Year instead of 2019, it would represent 15.1% of all new aid. As Florida has learned, the credit grows insidiously by political pressure from corporations and (in New York's case) individuals because tax credits are so much more valuable than tax deductions.

better metrics are needed to understand why some charter schools are serving higher percentages of students in these categories than others. The Governor alluded to "anti-creaming" in his State of the State address in 2015, but in this year's Aid to Localities Article VII language, it appears that charter schools are to be granted state funding increases irrespective of their policies which might discriminate against various categories of students. We were not surprised to learn of litigation filed against Success Academies this past December, based on statistics just in one Assembly District, and caution the Legislature to ensure that seemingly superior academic results are not simply based on selective admission or dismissal practices. This is an area ripe for further research. In no event should well-resourced charter schools be placed in higher priority for state tax dollars than the schools in their own districts. The Forms 990 that were part of our research confirm that charter management organizations benefit from generous private donations and in kind donations.

### 3) IN LIEU OF TAX CAPS, PROVIDE SERIOUS INCENTIVES FOR CONSOLIDATION.

There are so many districts in New York State with fewer than 1,000 pupils, and so many counties that have duplicated services, that it is understandable that the Governor is trying to encourage consolidations and efficiencies. However, the Governor's proposals do not go far enough to truly encourage consolidation, as the lack of movement in that direction has shown. The League opposes the tax caps, but that by no means implies that we condone fiefdoms. Tax caps are harming communities because they were ill-designed as percentage levy caps. Tax caps encourage evasion by those districts that can raise funds outside the cap. They force school business officers to plead for amendments to a formula that was ill-designed to begin with. Tax caps should be replaced with even stronger incentives to operate with greater economies of scale, for example perhaps by working with State Education Department to identify and then reward districts that operate at optimal economies of scale. The League supports sharing of tax bases across regions. Until the state moves in this direction more seriously, it will continue to operate inefficiently with far too many local government units.

We urge you to consider these views of a good government organization that stands to gain nothing but a better educated citizenry, capable of participating fully in the civic and economic future of New York State.

# Attachment 1 to Testimony January 27, 2016 High Tax Aid Formula

### S. HIGH TAX AID

[Section 3602 (16) of the Education Law] (2008-09 Estimated Total = \$202.3 Million)

Selected High Tax Aid =

a. Greater of Total High Tax Aid or 70% of 2007-08 High Tax Aid for districts with APWR less than 2.0

OR

b. Greater of Total High Tax Aid or 50% of 2007-08 High Tax Aid for all other districts
 Total High Tax Aid = Tier 1 High Tax Aid + Tier 2 High Tax Aid + Tier 3 High Tax Aid
 Tier 1 High Tax Aid =

Greater of \$100,000 OR (\$450 X State Sharing Ratio X base year public school enrollment) Eligible districts:

- c. Income Wealth Index (IWI) for Foundation Aid < 2.5 and
- d. 2006-07 AOE/TAPU for Expense greater than the State Average (\$10,650) and
- e. Tax Effort Ratio exceeds .03200 (3.2%).

Tax Effort Ratio =

Total 2005 Residential Tax Levy w/ Condominiums divided by Total 2005 Adjusted Gross Income Tier 2 High Tax Aid =

[2006-07 AOE/TAPU for Expense - \$10,660 (min=0)]

Х

[1 – (0.6 X Alternate Pupil Wealth Ratio (APWR)] (min=0 / max=1)

X

Regional Cost Index (See Section A on Foundation Aid)

Χ

Base Year Enrollment X .181

Eligible districts are those with a Tax Effort Ratio greater than .0500 or 5%

Tier 3 High Tax Aid = \$52 X Regional Cost Index X Base Year Enrollment

Eligible districts:

- a. Combined Wealth Ratio (CWR) less than 6.0 and
- b. Regional Cost Index greater than 1.300 and
- c. Quotient of 2005 AV/2006-07 TWPU divided by 2005 AGI /2006-07 TWPU is greater than 4.620

## Attachment 2 to Testimony January 27, 2016

LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS OF NEW YORK STATE COMPARISON OF 2016-17 HIGH TAX AID vs. STRUGGLING SCHOOLS and COMMUNITY SCHOOL DISTRICTS

County	School District	2016-17 Proposed High Tax Aid	County Total if more than one recipient	On Regents List of 144 Struggling Schools in 17 Districts?		2016-17 Proposed Community Schools Aid
Albany				ALBANY CITY SD	Albany	\$2,696,127
	Bethlehem	\$950,728				
***************************************					Cohoes	\$110,625
					Green Island	\$17,390
					Watervliet	\$94,487
Allegany					Andover	\$41,343
					Genesee Valley	\$65,066
				1 SEP 1 THE SE AND	Belfast	\$44,520
					Canaseraga	\$24,622
					Friendship	\$51,013
					Fillmore	\$84,252
					Whitesville	\$26,719
					Cuba-Rushford	\$67,917
					Scio	\$47,097
					Wellsville	\$114,359
					Bolivar-Richbg	\$102,276
Broome				` ;	Binghamton	\$477,949
					Harpursville	\$89,804
			-		Chenango Valley	\$46,359
	Deposit	\$290,478			Deposit	\$37,615
		771 102.00.1			Whitney Point	\$152,109
			-11		Johnson City	\$179,735
Cattaraugus					Franklinville	ć04 r02
						\$84,503
				- Manga	Hinsdale	\$47,128
	12/	\$166,648			Cattaraugus-LI	\$89,771
	West Valley	\$166,648			Olean	\$129,603
			***************************************		Gowanda	\$122,173
					Randolph	\$88,646
	1			<del></del>	Salamanca	\$139,051
			,		Yorkshire-Pione	\$210,306
						7210,000
Cayuga		p p Make pro to have the automated of			Auburn	\$211,759
Chautauqua			\$1,041,564		,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	

1	Chautaugua	\$256,703			
5,422.54	Clymer	\$111,903	W/	A relegiale (*)	
	Brocton	\$275,127			
700	Ripley	\$147,825	\$7.00x 10.00		•
W/ 0000	Westfield	\$250,006	7.05.202.5		
	112	a se é haça a ha, in hapit de la reja, auss ann na ha	N 12-21 2	Cassadaga Vall	\$99,547
-0.00000000	12.00 m			Pine Valley	\$67,455
	1124		10 July 10	Clymer	\$28,267
	2000	The second a serie man in		Dunkirk	\$224,658
	- Militari Inco	1,554-14	120000	Silver Creek	\$68,538
	All agentary bloss			Forestville	\$34,773
	1100-1707			Jamestown	\$422,610
56.80%	The state of the s	The second of th	1447	Brocton	\$63,939
				Ripley	\$18,495
	2000 22		19400	Sherman	\$45,067
with the deposit of a		1771 a hidrid ampa m 11139 4 % 00 1 00	established and the second	Westfield	\$46,542
	5414				
Chemung				Elmira	\$501,348
Chenango	A	-			
<u> </u>	Afton	\$283,125	•	Afton	\$62,527
	1000			Greene	\$87,782
	***************************************			Unadilla	\$90,571
		No de Posses		Norwich	\$155,921
	******			Georgetown-So OTS	\$34,626
			F _ 1	Oxford	\$80,443
				Sherburne Earl	\$154,286
Clinton			\$791,744	Township of the N	
	Ausable Valley	\$283,996		Ausable Valley	\$82,258
	Plattsburgh	\$507,748		Plattsburgh	\$75,055
				Beekmantown	\$98,308
				Northern Adiron	\$84,115
Columbia			\$1,230,764	0.0000	
	Copake-Taconic	\$352,002	7-7-1-5,1-5		
	Germantown	\$143,067		**************************************	
	Chatham	\$148,960		- Carrie	
	Hudson	\$218,990		Hudson	\$86,263
	Kinderhook	\$224,558		The state of the s	
	New Lebanon	\$143,187	- Contract		
Cortland				Cincinnatus	\$71,378
			Approximately and the second s	Cortland	\$147,875
				McGraw	\$51,558
				Marathon	\$79,560

	Andes	\$100,000				
	Downsville	\$237,714		(44)	Downsville	\$10,000
	Charlotte Valley	\$181,328			Charlotte Valley	\$27,92
	Franklin	\$100,000		1.000	Franklin	\$19,086
	Hancock	\$249,655			Hancock	\$34,174
	Margaretville	\$70,000			Margaretville	\$10,000
	Roxbury	\$192,600				720,000
	Sidney	\$125,580			Sidney	\$98,699
	Stamford	\$92,649		No. 100 pil 1 -	Stamford	\$20,137
	S. Kortright	\$100,000			S. Kortright	\$23,420
	Walton	\$117,847			Walton	\$82,541
Dutchess	- Chiga		\$2,679,203		- Traiton	702,541
	Hyde Park	\$727,915				***
	Northeast	\$232,682		-		
	Pawling	\$505,490				
***************************************	Pine Plains	\$27,384	~ ~ ~ ~ ~			
	Arlington	\$222,138			******	
	Spackenkill	\$341,381			- I annual part	
	Red Hook	\$438,238			- 349	2.554
	Rhinebeck	\$100,000			14-	
.=	Hillbrook	\$83,975	*****		- 1000	
	711111111111111111111111111111111111111	700,010	***************************************		Beacon	¢07.740
=				SD		\$87,748
				30	Poughkeepsie	\$1,747,582
Erie			77.7	BUFFALO CITY SD	Buffalo	\$12,524,617
	Sloan	\$520,911			Sloan	\$68,242
				The state of	Lackawanna	\$293,188
Essex			¢1 F00 740			
ESSEX	Crown Point	¢70,000	\$1,588,719			
****	Elizabethtown	\$70,000			Crown Point	\$24,277
		\$100,000			Elizabethtown	\$14,844
	Keene	\$170,528				
	Minerva	\$285,697		223		
	Moriah	\$75,884			Moriah	\$76,592
	Newcomb	\$70,000				
	Lake Placid	\$150,669				
	Schroon Lake	\$181,474				
,P**	Ticonderoga	\$247,326			Ticonderoga	\$36,467
	Westport	\$109,232				
	Hillsboro	\$127,909				
Franklin			\$316,650			
8	Saranac Lake	\$227,664				
	St. Regis Falls	\$88,986		•	St. Regis Falls	\$30,078
					Chateaugay	\$43,580
					Salmon River	\$200,831
					Brushton Moira	\$102,613

			A		
Fulton		4445.000	\$217,577		
and the state of the same	Wheelerville	\$142,853			
	Northville	\$74,724			Acres a second process on many sectors are
				Gloversville	\$257,549
				Johnstown	\$98,329
Genesee					÷
dellesee	Batavia	\$729,993		Batavia	\$116,085
Greene			\$1,231,970		<u>`</u>
	Cairo-Durham	\$184,142			
	Catskill	\$188,575	\$11 vg paping hapleggap <u>an</u> at 2 and high-paping	Catskill	\$69,599
	Coxsackie Ath	\$166,717			
ng tatin managkan sikapagkan di	Greenville	\$281,504			
	Hunter Tanners	\$210,056			
	Windham Ashlan	\$200,976			
Hamilton			\$813,070		
	Indian Lake	\$223,843			
	Lake Pleasant	\$180,008			
	Long Lake	\$202,087			
	Wells	\$207,132			^
Herkimer					
	Town of Webb	\$271,313			
				West Canada Va	\$58,917
				Herkimer	\$64,467
				Little Falls	\$76,292
				. Dolgeville	´\$82,884
				Poland	\$37,498
				Van Hornsville	\$18,604
				Mt. Markham CSD	\$101,498
				Central Valley	\$154,059
Jefferson		460 554			- Ase on a
	Lyme	\$62,551		Lyme Indian River	\$15,854 \$404,452
		The same specific and the same same same same same same same sam		Belleville-Hen	
				La Fargeville	\$2 <b>1</b> ,795 \$36,602
<u> </u>				Watertown	
					\$222,343
				Carthage	\$273,578
Lewis				Copenhagen	\$35,037
				Lowville	\$117,907
				South Lewis	\$95,627
				Beaver River	\$67,970
<del></del>					7-1,010
Livingston				Mount Morris	\$58,594
				Dansville	\$136,766
				Dalton-Nunda	\$65,630

Madison	****	***				200
Miduisoff	DeRuyter	\$158,847	¥ ********	<u>.</u>	D-Di	4
	Denayter	7130,047			DeRuyter	\$38,79
					Brookfield	\$24,97
***************************************					Morrisville EA	\$62,49
····	V. 1		<u></u>		Madison	\$43,80
					Stockbridge VA	\$38,53
Monroe			\$1,661,950	ROCHESTER CITY SD	Rochester	\$7,624,90
	Gates Chili	\$1,154,706		***************************************		7.702.1,00
	East Rochester	\$325,321				
•	Wheatland Chil	\$181,923		44,		
Montgomer	'y		\$495,319	AMSTERDAM CITY SD	Amsterdam	\$365,46
	Fort Plain	\$344,565			Fort Plain	\$86,18
	Op-Eph-St Jhns	\$150,754			Op-Eph-St Jhns	\$86,64
Nassau			\$58,664,701		Op Epir-Schills	\$60,04
	Glen Cove	\$317,335				
	Hempstead	\$2,687,597		HEMPSTEAD UFSD	Hempstead	\$3,123,050
	Uniondale	\$1,755,704		7.2 0,12,12 0,102	Uniondale	
	East Meadow	\$3,378,742			Officiale	\$362,88
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	North Bellmore	\$947,589				
	Levittown	\$4,406,095				
	Seaford	\$710,955			.,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	
	Bellmore	\$413,153		<u> </u>		
	Roosevelt	\$3,926,511		ROOSEVELT UFSD	December 1	4252.00
	Freeport	\$3,657,932		ROOSEVELT OFSD	Roosevelt	\$353,005
	Baldwin	\$2,262,592			Freeport	\$479,702
	Oceanside	\$2,030,230			.,	
	Malverne	\$599,691		The state of the s		
	V Str Thirteen	\$805,075				
<u> </u>	Hewlett Woodmere	\$229,331				
	Lawrence	\$240,598		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	ļ	
	Elmont	\$1,401,076			****	
	Franklin Square	\$553,249				
	Garden City	\$333,249				<del> </del>
	East Rockaway				146 -	
	Lynbrook	\$575,562				
	Rockville Center	\$395,881		100000		
		\$376,635			1000	
	Floral Park	\$161,576			- 141	
	Wantagh	\$872,758			<u> </u>	-,
	V Str Twenty-F	\$1,099,857				
	Merrick	\$193,215				
	Island Trees	\$1,342,564		10HA		
	West Hempstead	\$520,201		10		
	North Merrick	\$620,873	1.00			
	Valley Stream UF	\$358,885				
Į.	Island Park	\$151,277				

	Valley Stream CHS	\$475,099				
-(6):	Sewanhaka	\$889,779		100-1		MACATE CONTROL OF THE
	Bellmore-Merrick	\$630,887			2 2 2 2	1000000
	Long Beach	\$417,052				
	Westbury	\$3,531,123			Westbury	\$403,563
	East Williston	\$136,611				
	Roslyn	\$250,393				
	Port Washington	\$361,671				
,	New Hyde Park	\$458,062				
	Manhasset	\$215,117				
	Great Neck	\$452,843				
	Herricks	\$425,196	,			
	Mineola	\$290,733				200000000000000000000000000000000000000
	Carle Place	\$233,260			,	
	North Shore	\$212,171		///		
	Syosset	\$697,595				
	Locust Valley	\$167,690	g/gg/ A14 p/%			
	Plainview	\$1,623,853				
	Oyster Bay	\$122,398			~-	
	Jericho	\$239,788				
	Hicksville	\$938,243				
		\$1,440,012				
	Plainedge	\$1,440,012	and the state of t			
	Bethpage					
	Farmingdale	\$3,243,907				
	Massapequa	\$2,035,976			AT .41 T.	
Niagara		C404 47F				
	Lewiston Porte	\$491,475			Ni c-ll-	6700 000
					Niagara Falls	\$733,330
Oneida				UTICA CITY SD		
	Remsen	\$203,231			Remsen	\$32,650
					Adirondack	\$98,303
					Camden	\$243,929
					Rome	\$369,655
					Utica	\$273,267
Onondaga			\$1,254,921	SYRACUSE CITY SD	Syracuse	\$10,186,478
	E Syracuse-Min	\$916,120	,,,,,			
	Fabius-Pompey	\$202,348				
	Lyncourt	\$136,453				
					Solvay	\$85,506
Ontario			\$394,053			
	Naples	\$258,763	عقد البريش بدائس ر	- Marie - Mari		
	Honeoye	\$135,290				
					Geneva	\$146,409
			-			
Orange			\$11,427,747			

	WashIngtonville	\$500,874				
-	Chester	\$192,726			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
S 5555	Cornhall	\$344,880				
	Pine Bush	\$646,971				
<u> </u>	Goshen	\$526,970	****			-
	Highland Falls	\$317,551	74.V-			***
	Middletown	\$714,091			Middletown	6602 544
<del> </del>	Minisink Valley	\$492,317			ivilagietown	\$683,511
***************************************	Monroe Woodbur	\$1,602,240				
	Kiryas Joel	\$70,000			100	4
<u> </u>	Valley Montgomery	\$536,651			Kiryas Joel	\$10,000
	Newburgh	\$3,600,531		NEW COLL CON CO.		1
	Port Jervis	\$3,000,531		NEWBURGH CITY SD	Newburgh	\$837,244
	Tuxedo	<del></del>			Port Jervis	\$189,220
		\$50,000				
	Warwick Valley	\$780,717				
	Greenwood Lake	\$426,016			<u> </u>	<u> </u>
0.1	Florida	\$281,467	4			
Orleans	- 4A A		\$766,569			
	Albion	\$256,623	b		Albion	\$171,687
	Kendall	\$101,659				
	Holley	\$129,497				
	Medina	\$198,267			Medina	\$135,337
- ##	Lyndonville	\$80,523	7740 100			
Oswego						
7.7	Sandy Creek	\$250,743			Sandy Creek	\$72,287
					Altmar Parish	\$154,393
					Fulton	\$241,424
					Hannibal	\$149,286
					Pulaski	\$89,146
Otsego				1 4 1 7		
	Cherry Valley-Spr	\$148,902			Cherry Valley-Spr	\$29,704
					Glbtsvlle-MtU	\$30,930
		-		*****	Edmeston	\$30,288
					Laurens	\$32,110
					Schenevus	\$29,516
					Milford	\$28,281
	***************************************				Morris	\$45,012
					Otego-Unadilla	\$72,613
					Richfield Springs	\$37,071
					Worcester	\$26,862
				ANT.		920,602
				- 27 2004		
Putnam			\$5,671,065			
	Mahopac	\$1,391,526	70,072,000			
,,,	Carmel	\$1,733,245				
	Haldane	\$194,828				
	Garrison	\$120,225		****		
	Caltisuii	\$120,225			L	

	Putnam Valley	\$925,561				
	Brewster	\$1,305,680			######################################	F100000
Rensselaer				TROY CITY SD	***************************************	
	Berlin	\$168,884				
					Lansingburgh	\$170,080
					Rensselaer	\$74,616
-1440					Troy	\$277,420
1,14						
Rockland			\$9,733,416			-
TOCKIUTIU	Clarkstown	\$1,129,414	<b>4-77</b>	ما مان بالله و و بربار ۱۱ الله و مسا	4.7	
	Nanuet	\$401,645				
	Haverstran-St	\$5,419,391		\\		
	S. Orangetown	\$327,764				
	Nyack	\$257,531				
	Pearl River	\$928,893				
		\$539,632				
	Ramapo				Fact Damone	\$360,848
	East Ramapo	\$729,146	ATAC DEE		East Ramapo	\$300,648
St. Lawrence		4005 445	\$715,755		of the state of th	647.027
The same of the sa	Clifton Fine	\$326,146			Clifton Fine	\$17,837
	Hammond	\$69,877			Hammond	\$18,750
	Hermon Dekalb	\$164,835			Hermon Dekalb	\$49,211
	Morristown	\$154,897			Morristown	\$25,106
			v	3444	Brasher Falls	\$146,944
				المراور والوارد والوار	Gouverneur	\$197,139
					Lisbon	\$56,498
					Madrid Wadding	\$59,412
					Massena .	\$227,985
					Norwood Norfolk	\$116,262
	a rate of the		Plan W		Ogdensburg	\$126,942
and American					Heuvelton	\$53,905
mate the first					Parishville	\$35,003
	^^		Action and the second second		Edwards-Knox	\$95,261
	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,					
				130000000		
				(6-7)		
		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,				
Saratoga						
วลเลเบรูล	Edinburg	\$193,761				
Cala on a start.	Lumuig	71.73,701		SCHENECTADY CITY SD	Schenectady	\$642,884
Schenectady	Schalmont	\$405,052		OCHERCIADI CITI DE	Joneticology	9072,004
	Schaimont	\$405,032	***************************************	,,,,,,,,,		
			¢574 240			
Schoharie		6420.484	\$571,342			
	Gilboa Conesvi	\$139,184			n at dall at	dra acc
	Middleburgh	\$347,920			Middleburgh	\$58,936
	Sharon Springs	\$84,238			Sharon Springs	\$26,994
					Jefferson	\$22,350

Schuyler		mb y (* ; * 1)* de	16.614		Odessa Montour	\$70,110
Seneca			\$398,825			
Serieca	South Seneca	\$273,715	3350,0Z3		South Seneca	\$49,76
	Romulus	\$125,110		The Party Maria collision and a description of the Collision of the Collis	Romulus	\$22,112
J	110111111111111111111111111111111111111				Waterloo Cent	\$123,111
						7)
Steuben			e see Tarbous destributes " se t a saare bibliothe destribu	1. (1.1)	·	
	Hammondsport	\$193,401				
					Addison	\$132,624
	to the commence contains whom to the theretains with the commence contains and the				Avoca	\$40,506
					Bath	\$139,788
					Bradford	\$28,058
					Campbell-Savon	\$81,862
					Canisteo-Green	\$105,783
					Hornell	\$152,327
		***			Prattsburg	\$35,110
					Jasper-Trpsbrg	\$65,899
Suffolk		4644 1114	\$88,071,045	WYANDANCH UFSD	· ·	
	Babylon	\$641,751				
	West Babylon	\$1,733,369				
	North Babylon Lindenhurst	\$1,678,344 \$2,616,972				
		\$1,710,034			C!	4200 000
	Copiague Amityville	\$1,275,598			Coplague	\$308,995
	Deer Park	\$2,685,418			Amityville	\$140,803
	Wyandanch	\$2,191,435	•		Wyandanch	¢402.010
	Three Village	\$826,783			VVydriudifCti	\$402,010
	Comsenogue	\$1,158,391				
	Sachem	\$4,022,826				
	Port Jefferson	\$94,118		<u>, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , </u>		
	Mount Sinai	\$393,079		*	****	
	Miller Place	\$1,040,107				
	Rocky Point	\$853,478			ــــــــــــــــــــــــــــــــــــــ	
	Middle Country	\$2,387,787				
<del></del>	Longhood	\$4,041,841				
	Patchogue-Medf	\$1,791,109				
	William Floyd	\$3,752,477			William Floyd	\$492,842
	Center Moriche	\$795,746				7.00,000
	East Moriches	\$323,352				
	South Country	\$2,794,176		رب چيداوي پايين ادمانوار پرهاندان هيدان او ميدانواداندان کا داد ادوا وي ويسيديد		
	East Hampton	\$143,681		<del></del>		
	Amagansett	\$50,000				
	Springs	\$342,209		and the Personal Property Services		
	Sag Harbor	\$165,430				
	Montauk	\$169,986				

----

,

	Elwood	\$1,046,049				
	Cold Spring	\$155,612		1.000		
	Huntington	\$442,003				
	Northport	\$735,742				
	Half Hollow Hi	\$1,355,779	Addition of the ordinary of the			
	Harborfields	\$627,527	1			
	Commack	\$3,253,567				
	S. Huntington	\$2,827,798				
	Bay Shore	\$2,717,904	Control of the contro		. ••	
	Islip	\$1,027,361				
	East Islip	\$1,721,431			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
	Sayville	\$1,729,079	manufacture of the same			
	Bayport Blue P	\$1,440,718		20 0 000 000 P. are as		
	Hauppauge	\$545,250		40-44		
	Connetquot	\$3,199,157	100111000000000000000000000000000000000		The second secon	
	West Islip	\$1,155,461		riddiniti. a unita terito a		1
	Brentwood	\$7,048,331			Brentwood	\$2,089,437
	Central Islip	\$7,350,865		CENTRAL ISLIP UFSD	Central Islip	\$650,359
	Fire Island	\$50,000		***		,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,
	Shoreham-Wadin	\$1,167,111				
	Riverhead	\$2,256,813			The state of the s	
	Shelter Island	\$100,000				
	Smithtown	\$1,934,010				
	Kings Park	\$859,400		1 =		
	Rensenburg	\$147,522				
	Westhampton Beach	\$234,417	***************************************			
	Quogue	\$50,000				
	Hampton Bays	\$581,735				
	Southampton	\$119,010				
	Bridgehampton	\$50,000			***	
	Eastport-South	\$894,355		A CANALANA.		
	Tuckhoe Commo	\$287,815				
	East Quogue	\$133,715				
	Oysterponds	\$100,000				
	Fishers Island	\$100,000				
	Southold	\$298,147				
	Greenport	\$148,016				
	Mattituck-Cutc	\$499,848		and the substitution of th		
Sullivan			\$4,826,992			
	Fallsburgh	\$1,256,108	***************************************		Fallsburgh	\$111,523
	Eldred	\$277,167				
	Liberty	\$622,393			Liberty	\$141,704
	Trì Valley	\$312,668	The state of the s	140 240		
	Roscoe	\$259,709				
	Livingston Manor	\$340,786			Livingston Manor	\$32,996
	Monticello	\$1,124,077			Monticello	\$185,418
	Sullivn West	\$634,084		4 - 18 - 27 - 18 - 27 - 27 - 27 - 27 - 27 - 27 - 27 - 2		

	6 4	1411	16.5		145.500	
Tioga	*** /*** · · ·				Waverly	\$120,31
					Candor	\$69,40
					Spencer Van ET	\$76,10
Tompkins					Tioga	\$99,41
	Lansing	\$266,111				
					Newfield	\$60,998
Uister			\$6,083,681	** HARLE		
	Kingston	\$1,621,490			Kingston	\$241,138
<u></u>	Highland	\$202,082				
	Rondout Valley	\$1,564,377				
	Marlboro	\$457,991				
	New Paltz	\$237,136				
	Onteora	\$715,413				
	Saugerties	\$342,714				
	Wallkill	\$379,007				
	Ellenville	\$563,471			Ellenville	\$370,088
Warren			\$2,094,236			
	Bolton .	\$179,940	1,000			
	North Warren	\$251,952		41		
	Glens Falls	\$250,952				
	Johnsburg	\$265,147	~ P4 m4 de o			
	Lake George	\$110,011				
	Hadley Luzerne	\$97,741	~~~	To the spike service service.	Hadley Luzerne	\$37,868
	Queensbury	\$405,813			Tradity Editoria	<b>\$37,808</b>
	Glens Falls Co	\$70,000			Glens Falls	\$10,000
	Warrensburg	\$462,680			Warrensburg	\$57,996
Washington			\$609,217		- Tarrenssarg	757,550
	Fort Ann	\$202,115				
	Hartford	\$138,624				
	Putnam	\$140,955		<u> </u>	Putnam	\$10,000
	Salem	\$127,523		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	i delani	\$10,000
					Fort Edward	\$32,403
			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		Granville	\$86,044
				, = 300 t s = 1	Hudson Falls	\$125,709
··				T M MITTER	Whitehall	
	-			****	AATHECHON	\$46,192
Wayne						1
	Sodus	\$400,577			Sodus	\$100 000
		<del></del>		·	Newark	\$100,038
						\$137,556
				Transition of the Property of	Clyde-Savannah	\$84,797
	- Marie Production			w	Lyons	\$89,298
	- 4144				N. Rose-Wolcot	\$107,958
	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,				Red Creek	\$87,007
Vestchester			\$11,859.828 YO	ONKERS CITY SD		

	Katonah Lewisb	\$100,000			
	Croton Harmon	\$100,000	- a commark to injure		10. 20. 10. 10.
	Hendrick Hudson	\$349,156	The state of the s		
	Eastchester	\$323,759			
	Tuckahoe	\$100,000		.,	
	Dobbs Ferry	\$100,000			
	Hastings on Hudson	\$129,492			
	Ardsley	\$193,387			
	Elmsford	\$167,166			
	Mt. Pleasant Center	\$822,562			
	Pocantico Hills	\$22,343		The state of the s	
	Valhalla	\$806,693			
	Pleasantville	\$183,316			
	Mount Vernon	\$2,045,117	MT VERNON SD	Mount Vernon	\$517,463
	New Rochelle	\$663,963			
	North Salem	\$100,000			
	Ossining	\$29,227		The state of the s	
	Briarcliff Manor	\$100,000			
	Peekskill	\$613,877		Peekskill	\$230,795
	Pelham	\$116,596			
	Port Chester	\$845,434		Port Chester	\$241,428
	Blind Brook-Rye Neck	\$100,000			
,,,,,,	Somers	\$141,256			
	Lakeland	\$2,416,117			
	Yorktown	\$1,020,367			
				Yonkers	\$4,286,726
<u> </u>	And the state of t		NEW YORK CITY	New York City	\$28,491,241
		\$222,666,027			
		\$223,298,324			\$99,663,640

.

		<i>s</i> , ,