# Legislative Bill Drafting Commission 08928-01-3

S. Senate

IN SENATE -- Introduced by Sen

--read twice and ordered printed, and when printed to be committed to the Committee on

Assembly

IN ASSEMBLY -- Introduced by M. of A.

with M. of A. as co-sponsors

--read once and referred to the Committee on

#### \*CRIMIPLA\*

(Authorizes the chief administrator of the courts to require and provide annual training regarding bail, recognizance, and commitment procedures and standards)

CP L. judicial bail training

### AN ACT

to amend the criminal procedure law, in relation to authorizing the chief administrator of the courts to require and provide at least three hours of annual training regarding bail, recognizance, and commitment procedures and standards

The People of the State of New York, represented in Senate and Assembly, do enact as follows:

### IN SENATE

Brad Hoylman Sigel

The senators whose names are circled below wish to join me in the sponsorship of this proposal:

s15 Addabbo	s34 Fernandez	s28 Krueger	s01 Palumbo	s42 Skoufis
s43 Ashby	s60 Gallivan	\$24 Lanza	s21 Parker	sl i Stavisky
s36 Bailey	s12 Gianaris	s16 Liu	s19 Persaud	s45 Stec
s57 Borrello	s59 Gonzalez	s50 Mannion	s13 Ramos	s35 Stewart-
s46 Breslin	s26 Gounardes	s04 Martinez	s05 Rhoads	Cousins
s25 Brisport	s53 Griffo	s07 Martins	s33 Rivera	s44 Tedisco
s55 Brouk	s40 Harckham	s02 Mattera	s39 Rolison	s06 Thomas
s09 Canzoneri-	s54 Helming	s48 May	s61 Ryan	s49 Walczyk
Fitzpatrick	s41 Hinchey	s37 Mayer	s18 Salazar	s52 Webb
s17 Chu	s47 Hoylman-	s03 Мштау	s10 Sanders	s38 Weber
s30 Cleare	Sigal	s20 Myrie	s23 Scarcella-	s08 Weik
s14 Comrie	s31 Jackson	s51 Oberacker	Spanton	
s56 Cooney	s27 Kavanagh	s58 O'Mara	s32 Sepulveda	
s22 Felder	s63 Kennedy	s62 Ortt	s29 Serrano	
	-			

#### IN ASSEMBLY

### Assembly introducer's signature

The Members of the Assembly whose names are circled below wish to join me in the multi-sponsorship of this proposal:

a078 Alvarez	a140 Conrad	a150 Goodell	a017 Mikulin	a016 Sillitti
a031 Anderson	a032 Cook	al 16 Gray	a122 Miller	a052 Simon
a121 Angelino	a039 Cruz	a100 Gunther	a051 Mitaynes	a075 Simone
a037 Ardīla	a043 Cunningham	al 39 Hawley	a 145 Morinello	a114 Simpson
a035 Aubry	a021 Curran	a083 Heastie	a144 Norris	a094 Slater
a120 Barclay	a018 Darling	a028 Hevesi	a045 Novakhov	a005 Smith
a 106 Barrett	a053 Davila	a128 Hunter	a069 O'Donnell	al 18 Smullen
a105 Beephan	a072 De Los Santos	a029 Hyndman	a091 Otis	a022 Solages
a107 Bendett	a003 DeStefano	a079 Jackson	a132 Palmesano	al 10 Steck
a082 Benedetto	a070 Dickens	a104 Jacobson	a088 Paulin	a010 Stern
a042 Bichotte	a054 Dilan	a011 Jean-Pierre	al41 Peoples-	a127 Stirpe
Hermelyn	a081 Dinowitz	a134 Jensen	Stokes	a102 Tague
al 17 Blankenbush	a147 DiPietro	al 15 Jones	a023 Pheffer	a064 Tannousis
a015 Blumencranz	a009 Durso	a077 Joyner	Amato	a086 Tapia
a073 Bores	a099 Eachus	a125 Kelles	a063 Pirozzolo	a071 Taylor
a098 Brabenec	a048 Eichenstein	a040 Kim	a089 Pretlow	a001 Thiele
a026 Braunstein	a074 Epstein	a013 Lavine	a019 Ra	a033 Vanel
a138 Bronson	a109 Fahy	a065 Lee	a030 Raga	a055 Walker
a046 Brook-Krasny	a061 Fall	al 26 Lemondes	a038 Rajkumar	a143 Wallace
a020 Brown, E.	a008 Fitzpatrick	a095 Levenberg	a006 Ramos	al 12 Walsh
a012 Brown, K.	a004 Flood	a060 Lucas	a062 Reilly	a041 Weinstein
a093 Burdick	a057 Forrest	al35 Lunsford	a087 Reyes	a024 Weprin
a085 Burgos	al 24 Friend	a123 Lupardo	a149 Rivera	a059 Williams
a142 Burke	a050 Gallagher	al 29 Magnarelli	a027 Rosenthal, D.	al 13 Woemer
al 19 Buttenschon	a131 Gallahan	a101 Maher	a067 Rosenthal, L.	a080 Zaccaro
a133 Byrnes	a007 Gandolfo	a036 Mamdani	a025 Rozic	a096 Zebrowski
a044 Carroll	a068 Gibbs	a130 Manktelow	alli Santabarbara	a056 Zinerman
a058 Chandler-	a002 Giglio, J.A.	a108 McDonald	a090 Sayegh	
Waterman	al 48 Giglio, J.M.	a014 McDonough	a076 Scawright	
a049 Chang	a066 Glick	a097 McGowan	a084 Septimo	
a 136 Clark	a034 Gonzalez-	a146 McMahon	a092 Shimsky	
a047 Colton	Rojas	a137 Meeks	a103 Shrestha	

- 1) Single House Bill (introduced and printed separately in either or both houses). Uni-Bill (introduced simultaneously in both houses and printed as one bill. Senate and Assembly introducer sign the same copy of the bill).
- 2) Circle names of co-sponsors and return to introduction clerk with 2 signed copies of bill and: in Assembly 2 copies of memorandum in support, in Senate 4 copies of memorandum in support (single house); or 4 signed copies of bill and 6 copies of memorandum in support (uni-bill).

- 1 Section 1. The section heading of section 10.40 of the criminal proce-
- 2 dure law, as amended by chapter 237 of the laws of 2015, is amended and
- 3 new subdivision 1-a is added to read as follows:
- 4 Chief administrator to prescribe forms, to require training and to
- 5 authorize use of electronic filing.
- 6 1-a. The chief administrator of the courts shall have the power and
- 7 responsibility to require and provide at least three hours of annual
- 8 training regarding bail, recognizance, and commitment procedures and
- 9 standards for all judges exercising preliminary jurisdiction over any
- 10 offense. Such training shall include a thorough explanation of relevant
- 11 and recent statutory changes to this chapter.
- 12 § 2. Section 10.40 of the criminal procedure law, as amended by chap-
- 13 ter 102 of the laws of 2020, is amended to read as follows:
- 14 § 10.40 Chief administrator to prescribe forms and to require training.
- 15 1. The chief administrator of the courts shall have the power to
- 16 adopt, amend and rescind forms for the efficient and just administration
- 17 of this chapter. Such forms shall include, without limitation, the forms
- 18 described in paragraph (z-1) of subdivision two of section two hundred
- 19 twelve of the judiciary law. A failure by any party to submit papers in
- 20 compliance with forms authorized by this section shall not be grounds
- 21 for that reason alone for denial or granting of any motion.
- 22 2. The chief administrator of the courts shall have the power and
- 23 responsibility to require and provide at least three hours of annual
- 24 training regarding bail, recognizance, and commitment procedures and
- 25 standards for all judges exercising preliminary jurisdiction over any
- 26 offense. Such training shall include a thorough explanation of relevant
- 27 and recent statutory changes to this chapter.

1 § 3. This act shall take effect on the first of January next succeed-

- 2 ing the date on which it shall have become a law; provided however, that
- 3 the amendments to section 10.40 of the criminal procedure law made by
- 4 section one of this act shall be subject to the expiration and reversion
- 5 of such section pursuant to section 11 of chapter 237 of the laws of
- 6 2015, as amended, when upon such date the provisions of section two of
- 7 this act shall take effect.

# NEW YORK STATE SENATE INTRODUCER'S MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT submitted in accordance with Senate Rule VI. Sec 1

# BILL NUMBER:

SPONSOR: HOYLMAN-SIGAL

# TITLE OF BILL:

An act to amend the criminal procedure law, in relation to authorizing the chief administrator of the courts to require and provide at least three hours of annual training regarding bail, recognizance, and commitment procedures and standards.

# PURPOSE:

To ensure judges and justices exercising jurisdiction over criminal pre-trial proceedings are adequately trained in the law and updated on relevant statutory changes.

# SUMMARY OF SPECIFIC PROVISIONS:

Sections 1 and 2 amend Criminal Procedure Law § 10.40 to provide the chief administrator of the courts the power and responsibility to provide three hours of annual training on bail, recognizance, and commitment procedures and standards for all judges exercising preliminary jurisdiction over any offense.

Section 2 is the effective date.

# JUSTIFICATION:

New York's criminal justice laws have gone through several significant changes in recent years, but there has been no statewide requirement that criminal court judges train and educate themselves about the changes in the law. This legislation will ensure that all judges exercising preliminary jurisdiction over criminal cases have adequate training to make decisions about bail, remand, and release on recognizance in accordance with the current law.

### LEGISLATIVE HISTORY:

New bill.

# FISCAL IMPLICATIONS:

TBD.

# EFFECTIVE DATE:

This act shall take effect on the first of January next succeeding the date on which it shall have become a law.

# Legislative Bill Drafting Commission 09076-01-3

s. . . . . . . . . Senate . . . . . . . .

IN SENATE -- Introduced by Sen

-- read twice and ordered printed, and when printed to be committed to the Committee on

> ----- A. Assembly

IN ASSEMBLY -- Introduced by M. of A.

with M. of A. as co-sponsors

-- read once and referred to the Committee on

# \*JUDILA\*

(Relates to the powers and authority of the state commission on judicial conduct)

. . . . . . . .

Jud. commission judicial conduct

# AN ACT

to amend the judiciary law, relation to requiring the state commission on judicial conduct to transmit its annual budget request to the governor for inclusion in the executive budget without revision; to complaints regarding judges; and to extending the jurisdiction of the state commission on judicial conduct as to judges who resign or retire while under investigation or formal charges

# IN SENATE

Senate introducer's signature

The senators whose names are circled below wish to join me in the sponsorship of this proposal:

s15 Addabbo	s34 Fernandez	s28 Krueger	s01 Palumbo	s42 Skoufis
s43 Ashby	s60 Gallivan	s24 Lanza	s21 Parker	s11 Stavisky
s36 Bailey	s12 Gianaris	s16 Liu	s19 Persaud	s45 Stec
s57 Borrello	s59 Gonzalez	s50 Mannion	s13 Ramos	s35 Stewart-
s46 Breslin	s26 Gounardes	s04 Martinez	s05 Rhoads	Cousins
s25 Brisport	s53 Griffo	s07 Martins	s33 Rivera	s44 Tedisco
s55 Brouk	s40 Harckham	s02 Mattera	s39 Rolison	s06 Thomas
s09 Canzoneri-	s54 Helming	s48 May	s61 Ryan	s49 Walczyk
Fitzpatrick	s41 Hinchey	s37 Mayer	s 18 Salazar	s52 Webb
s17 Chu	s47 Hoylman-	s03 Мштау	s10 Sanders	s38 Weber
s30 Cleare	Sigal	s20 Myrie	s23 Scarcella-	s08 Weik
s14 Comrie	s31 Jackson	s51 Oberacker	Spanton	
s56 Cooney	s27 Kavanagh	s58 O'Mara	s32 Sepulveda	
s22 Felder	s63 Kennedy	s62 Ortt	s29 Serrano	

### IN ASSEMBLY\_

### Assembly introducer's signature

The Members of the Assembly whose names are circled below wish to join me in the multi-sponsorship of this proposal:

a078 Alvarez	a140 Conrad	al 50 Goodell	a017 Mikulin	a016 Sillitti
a031 Anderson	a032 Cook	al 16 Gray	a122 Miller	a052 Simon
al21 Angelino	a039 Cruz	a 100 Gunther	a051 Mitaynes	a075 Simone
a037 Ardila	a043 Cunningham	a139 Hawley	a 145 Morinello	al 14 Simpson
a035 Aubry	a021 Curran	a083 Heastie	al 44 Norris	a094 Slater
a120 Barclay	a018 Darling	a028 Hevesi	a045 Novakhov	a005 Smith
al 06 Barrett	a053 Davila	al 28 Hunter	a069 O'Donnell	al 18 Smullen
a105 Beephan	a072 De Los Santos	a029 Hyndman	a091 Otis	a022 Solages
a107 Bendett	a003 DeStefano	a079 Jackson	a132 Palmesano	al 10 Steck
a082 Benedetto	a070 Dickens	a104 Jacobson	a088 Paulin	a010 Stern
a042 Bichotte	a054 Dilan	a011 Jean-Pierre	al41 Peoples-	a127 Stirpe
Hermelyn	a081 Dinowitz	a134 Jensen	Stokes	a102 Tague
al 17 Blankenbush	a 147 DiPietro	al 15 Jones	a023 Pheffer	a064 Tannousis
a015 Blumencranz	a009 Durso	a077 Joyner	Amato	a086 Tapia
a073 Bores	a099 Eachus	a125 Kelles	a063 Pirozzolo	a071 Taylor
a098 Brabenec	a048 Eichenstein	a040 Kim	a089 Pretlow	a001 Thiele
a026 Braunstein	a074 Epstein	a013 Lavine	a019 Ra	a033 Vanel
al 38 Bronson	a109 Fahy	a065 Lee	a030 Raga	a055 Walker
a046 Brook-Krasny	a061 Fall	a 126 Lemondes	a038 Rajkumar	a143 Wallace
a020 Brown, E.	a008 Fitzpatrick	a095 Levenberg	a006 Ramos	al 12 Walsh
a012 Brown, K.	a004 Flood	a060 Lucas	a062 Reilly	a041 Weinstein
a093 Burdick	a057 Foπest	a135 Lunsford	a087 Reyes	a024 Weprin
a085 Burgos	al24 Friend	a 123 Lupardo	al 49 Rivera	a059 Williams
al 42 Burke	a050 Gallagher	a 129 Magnarelli	a027 Rosenthal, D.	a113 Woemer
al 19 Buttenschon	al31 Gallahan	a 101 Maher	a067 Rosenthal, L.	a080 Zaccaro
al33 Byrnes	a007 Gandolfo	a036 Mamdani	a025 Rozic	a096 Zebrowski
a044 Carroll	a068 Gibbs	a130 Manktelow	alli Santabarbara	a056 Zinerman
a058 Chandler-	a002 Giglio, J.A.	a108 McDonald	a090 Sayegh	
Waterman	al 48 Giglio, J.M.	a014 McDonough	a076 Scawright	
a049 Chang	a066 Glick	a097 McGowan	a084 Septimo	
a136 Clark	a034 Gonzalez-	a 146 McMahon	a092 Shimsky	
a047 Colton	Rojas	a137 Meeks	a103 Shrestha	

<sup>1)</sup> Single House Bill (introduced and printed separately in either or both houses). Uni-Bill (introduced simultaneously in both houses and printed as one bill. Senate and Assembly introducer sign the same copy of the bill).

<sup>2)</sup> Circle names of co-sponsors and return to introduction clerk with 2 signed copies of bill and: in Assembly 2 copies of memorandum in support, in Senate 4 copies of memorandum in support (single house); or 4 signed copies of bill and 6 copies of memorandum in support (uni-bill).

09076-01-3

The People of the State of New York, represented in Senate and Assembly, do enact as follows:

- 1 Section 1. Section 42 of the judiciary law is amended by adding a new
- 2 subdivision 7 to read as follows:
- 3 7. To transmit its annual budget request to the governor for inclusion
- 4 in the executive budget without revision but with such recommendation as
- 5 the governor may deem proper.
- 6 § 2. Subdivision 4 of section 44 of the judiciary law, as added by
- 7 chapter 156 of the laws of 1978, is amended to read as follows:
- 8 4. If in the course of an investigation, the commission determines
- 9 that a hearing is warranted it shall direct that a formal written
- 10 complaint signed and verified by the administrator be drawn and served
- 11 upon the judge involved, either personally or by certified mail, return
- 12 receipt requested. The judge shall file a written answer to the [the]
- 13 formal written complaint with the commission within twenty days of such
- 14 service. The formal written complaint and answer, and the record of
- 15 proceedings thereafter, including the hearing and any proceedings before
- 16 the commission, shall be public. If, upon receipt of the answer, or upon
- 17 expiration of the time to answer, the commission shall direct that a
- 18 hearing be held with respect to the formal written complaint, the judge
- 19 involved shall be notified in writing of the date of the hearing either
- 20 personally, at least twenty days prior thereto, or by certified mail,
- 21 return receipt requested, at least twenty-two days prior thereto. Upon
- 22 the written request of the judge, the commission shall, at least five
- 23 days prior to the hearing or any adjourned date thereof, make available
- 24 to the judge without cost copies of all documents which the commission
- 25 intends to present at such hearing and any written statements made by
- 26 witnesses who will be called to give testimony by the commission. The
- 27 commission shall, in any case, make available to the judge at least five
- 28 days prior to the hearing or any adjourned date thereof any exculpatory

1 evidentiary data and material relevant to the formal written complaint.

2 The failure of the commission to timely furnish any documents, state-

3 ments and/or exculpatory evidentiary data and material provided for

herein shall not affect the validity of any proceedings before the

5 commission provided that such failure is not substantially prejudicial

5 to the judge. The complainant may be notified of the hearing and unless

he shall be subpoenaed as a witness by the judge, his presence thereat

s shall be within the discretion of the commission. [The hearing shall not

9 be public unless the judge involved shall so demand in writing.] At the

0 hearing the commission may take the testimony of witnesses and receive

11 evidentiary data and material relevant to the formal written complaint.

12 The judge shall have the right to be represented by counsel during any

13 and all stages of the hearing and shall have the right to call and

14 cross-examine witnesses and present evidentiary data and material rele-

15 vant to the formal written complaint. A transcript of the proceedings

16 and of the testimony of witnesses at the hearing shall be taken and kept

17 with the records of the commission.

18 § 3. Section 45 of the judiciary law, as amended by chapter 35 of the

19 laws of 1983, is amended to read as follows:

20 § 45. Confidentiality of records. [1.] Except as hereinafter provided,

21 all complaints, correspondence, commission proceedings and transcripts

22 thereof, other papers and data and records of the commission shall be

23 confidential and shall not be made available to any person except pursu-

24 ant to section forty-four of this article. The commission and its desig-

25 nated staff personnel shall have access to confidential material in the

6 performance of their powers and duties. If the judge who is the subject

27 of a complaint so requests in writing, copies of [the] any pending

28 complaint, [the transcripts of hearings by the commission thereon, if

- 1 any] any documents made public pursuant to section forty-four of this
- 2 article, and the dispositive action of the commission with respect to
- 3 [the] any complaint resulting in a caution, admonition, censure,
- 4 removal, retirement, or resignation from judicial office, such copies
- 5 with any reference to the identity of any person who did not participate
- 6 at any such hearing suitably deleted therefrom, except the subject judge
- 7 or complainant, shall be made available for inspection and copying to
- 8 the public, or to any person, agency or body designated by such judge.
- 9 [2. Notwithstanding any provision in this section, the commission,
- 10 with the consent of the applicant, shall provide the record of any
- 11 proceeding pursuant to a formal written complaint against an applicant
- 12 for judicial appointment in which the applicant's misconduct was estab-
- 13 lished, any pending complaint against an applicant, and the record to
- 14 date of any pending proceeding pursuant to a formal written complaint
- 15 against an applicant for judicial appointment:
- 16 (a) to the commission on judicial nomination established by article
- 17 three-A of this chapter, with respect to applicants for appointment to
- 18 the court of appeals;
- 19 (b) to the governor with respect to all applicants whom the governor
- 20 indicates are under consideration for any judicial appointment; and
- 21 (c) to the temporary president of the senate and the chairman of the
- 22 senate judiciary committee with respect to all nominees for judicial
- 23 appointments which are subject to the advice and consent of the senate.]
- 24 The commission shall respond within fifteen days of a request for the
- 25 information provided for in this [subdivision] section.
- 26 § 4. Section 47 of the judiciary law, as added by chapter 156 of the
- 27 laws of 1978, is amended to read as follows:

§ 47. Resignation or retirement not to divest commission or court of 1 appeals of jurisdiction. The jurisdiction of the court of appeals and 2 the commission pursuant to this article shall continue notwithstanding 3 that a judge resigns or retires from office after a [determination of the commission that the judge be removed from office has been transmitted to the chief judge of the court of appeals, | formal written complaint authorized pursuant to section forty-four of this article has been served on the judge or in any case in which the [commission's determination that a judge should be removed from office shall be transmitted to the chief judge of the court of apppeals] formal written complaint is served on the judge within one hundred twenty days after receipt by the chief administrator of the courts of the resignation or 12 retirement of such judge. Any determination by the court of appeals 13 that a judge who has resigned or retired should be removed from office 14 shall render such judge ineligible to hold any other judicial office. 15 The chief administrator of the courts shall give written notice to the 16 commission of the resignation or retirement of any judge who is the 17 subject of an investigation within five days after his receipt thereof. 18 § 5. This act shall take effect immediately. 19

# NEW YORK STATE SENATE INTRODUCER'S MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT submitted in accordance with Senate Rule VI. Sec 1

# BILL NUMBER:

SPONSOR: HOYLMAN-SIGAL

TITLE OF BILL: An act to amend the judiciary law, in relation to requiring the state commission on judicial conduct to transmit its annual budget request to the governor for inclusion in the executive budget without revision; to complaints regarding judges; and to extending the jurisdiction of the state commission on judicial conduct as to judges who resign or retire while under investigation or formal charges

# PURPOSE OR GENERAL IDEA OF BILL:

To increase the independence, transparency and jurisdiction of the Commission on Judicial Conduct

# SUMMARY OF PROVISIONS:

Section 1 requires the executive budget to transmit with comment but without amendment the Commission on Judicial Conduct's annual budget request to the Legislature

Sections 2 and 3 make Commission proceedings public when a judge is formally charged with misconduct

Section 4 extends the Commission's jurisdiction to judges who resign or retire while under investigation or formal charges.

Section 5 is the effective date.

### JUSTIFICATION:

The Commission on Judicial Conduct (CJC) ensures the public's trust in our judicial system by ensuring that an independent body investigates potential wrongdoing by judges and justices. This bill would enhance the CJC's ability to perform its work by ensuring the Legislature receives its annual budget request unmodified, providing greater transparency by making proceedings public when a judge or justice is formally charged with misconduct, and prevents judges and justices from escaping the CDC's jurisdiction simply by retiring or resigning.

# PRIOR LEGISLATIVE HISTORY:

New bill

### FISCAL IMPLICATIONS FOR STATE AND LOCAL GOVERNMENTS:

To be determined.

# EFFECTIVE DATE:

This act shall take effect immediately.